

LOWER MANHATTAN DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

**Amended Partial Action Plan No. 8
for
The World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program, Related Initiatives,
and Lower Manhattan Tourism**

Overview

The Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC) has prepared the following Amended Partial Action Plan with regard to the \$2 billion federal grant for the World Trade Center (WTC) disaster recovery and rebuilding efforts administered by the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). LMDC received additional funding through a \$783 million grant from HUD for damaged properties and businesses (including the restoration of utility infrastructure) as well as economic revitalization related to the terrorist attacks at the WTC on September 11, 2001. Other partial action plans detail the expenditure of the remainder of funds from the \$2.783 billion appropriation and are viewable on the LMDC website at <http://renewnyc.com/FundingInitiatives/PartialActionPlans.aspx>.

Partial Action Plan Activities	(\$) Original Allocation 11/2004	(\$) As Amended 10/2005	(\$) As Amended 12/2006	(\$) As Amended 05/2010	(\$) As Amended 12/2015
I. WTC Memorial and Cultural Program					
WTC Memorial and Memorial Museum	34,980,000	48,580,000	62,875,000	64,525,972	64,525,972
WTC Memorial Program Income	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000
WTC Performing Arts Center	12,260,000	16,360,000	11,004,000	11,004,000	11,004,000
WTC Museum Complex/Memorial Museum Pavilion	9,260,000	33,460,000	9,521,000	9,471,631	9,471,631
Subtotal WTC Memorial and Cultural Program	56,500,000	98,400,000	83,400,000	85,001,603	85,001,603
II. Tribute in Light	3,500,000	3,500,000	3,000,000	3,695,000	3,695,000
III. Story Corps WTC Story Booth	500,000	500,000	500,000	900,000	866,021
IV. Living Memorial	296,900	296,900	296,900	296,900	296,900
V. River to River Festival (Tourism)	200,000	700,000	700,000	700,000	700,000
Planning and Administration	3,262,995	5,494,574	5,494,574	5,494,574	5,494,574
Total (Excluding Program Income)	64,259,895	108,891,474	93,391,474	96,088,077	96,054,098

The original Partial Action Plan 8 detailed the expenditure of \$64,259,895 of the \$2.78 billion for the activities listed above. In addition, the use of \$1,000,000 in program income was identified. The plan was then amended four times.

The first amendment, made in October 2005, increased the total HUD funding by \$44,631,579 to a total of \$108,891,474. This amendment increased the allocation of funds for the World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program, the River to River Festival, and planning and administration.

The second amendment, made in December 2006, reduced total HUD funding by \$15,500,000 to a total of \$93,391,474. This amendment increased the allocation of funds for the WTC Memorial and Memorial Museum and decreased funds for the Performing Arts Center and the Museum Complex/Memorial Museum Pavilion. Additionally, this amendment conformed changes to facility names and changed the designated recipient of funds for the Living Memorial Project.

The third amendment made in May 2010, increased total HUD funding by \$2,696,603 to a total of \$96,088,077. The amendment increased the allocation of funds for the WTC Memorial and Memorial Museum, Tribute in Light, and the StoryCorps WTC StoryBooth.

The fourth amendment made in December 2015, reduced the total HUD funding by \$33,979 to a total of \$96,054,098. This amendment reduced the allocation of funds for the StoryCorps WTC StoryBooth by the residual balance in the completed program and returned the funds to the Community & Cultural Enhancements program in the Final Action Plan.

Any change greater than 5% in the funding committed to a certain activity, the addition or deletion of any activity, or designated change in the beneficiaries of an activity constitutes a substantial amendment and such amendment will be available for public review and approval by HUD.

National Objective

LMDC is a subsidiary of the New York State Urban Development Corporation d/b/a Empire State Development that was created in December 2001 to oversee the rebuilding and revitalization of Lower Manhattan. The activities contained in this Partial Action Plan were designed to meet particularly urgent community development needs resulting from the September 11th WTC disaster. These activities had particular urgency because LMDC had determined that existing conditions resulting from the WTC disaster posed a serious and immediate threat to the health or welfare of the City of New York and the individual residents of the City, and other financial resources were not available to meet such needs. The funds allocated in this Partial Action Plan relating to the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program also were for the prevention of blight that could have resulted absent intervention to address the conditions resulting from the events of September 11th. The geographic areas of focus for this and future Partial Action Plans are located in Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street.

Public Comment to the Partial Action Plan and Amendments

The original Partial Action Plan 8 as well as the first, second, and a portion of the third amendment were made available to the public for public comment. In order to invite public comment, LMDC placed advertisements in English, Spanish, and Chinese daily newspapers and in weekly community newspapers serving Lower Manhattan. The text of this amendment was made available on LMDC's website (www.renewnyc.com) and LMDC delivered and mailed copies of Partial Action Plan 4 with the proposed amendments in English, Spanish, and Chinese to more than 90 community, residential, civic and cultural organizations throughout Lower Manhattan, including Community Boards 1, 2, and 3, Manhattan, several tenants' associations and public libraries.

Partial Action Plan 8 and its amendments were made available for public comment as follows:

Original Plan	August 10, 2004 to September 8, 2004
First Amendment	May 17, 2005 to June 15, 2005
Second Amendment	September 29, 2006 to October 30, 2006
Third Amendment	March 23, 2010 to April 21, 2010

The portion of the third amendment relating to the WTC Memorial and Memorial Museum was a non-substantial amendment and was not released for public comment. The fourth Amendment was a non-substantial amendment and was not released for public comment.

Comments received and responses to those comments for the original plan and the first amendment may be viewed in Section VII and VIII below. There were no comments received on the second and third amendments.

Public Participation to Date

LMDC has solicited and received an unprecedented amount of public comment from all over the world regarding the rebuilding of the WTC Site, the creation of a permanent memorial, and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan. Since its inception LMDC has developed its action plans based on all information available to it including specific input gathered by LMDC through the channels that it created, many of which have focused on the redevelopment of the WTC Site, the Memorial, and broader issues such as transportation, cultural and civic issues, and economic development in the aftermath of September 11th.

LMDC created Advisory Councils representing a broad spectrum of groups affected by the WTC attacks – including victims’ families, business owners, arts and cultural institutions, and downtown residents – and has consulted extensively with them on issues of concern to their respective constituencies. LMDC also conducted public meetings that provided an avenue for the expression of thoughts and concerns about the rebuilding efforts and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan.

Other LMDC outreach initiatives, such as mailings to city, state, and federal elected officials and civic and community organizations, participation in Community Board meetings, and regular meetings with community groups, civic organizations, and public officials, ensure that the opinions of those impacted are taken into account. In the summer of 2003, LMDC conducted a series of outreach workshops in the communities of Lower Manhattan, at which participants described priorities for their communities and proposed projects to address those priorities.

LMDC has also sponsored several public exhibits that provided visitors with information and the opportunity to submit written comments on the revitalization efforts. LMDC received nearly 10,000 comments at the exhibits.

On April 13, 2005, the LMDC issued a Draft Funding Allocation Framework, which articulated draft priorities, objectives, and principles with respect to the allocation of the remaining CDBG funds. LMDC held a public forum on the draft Framework on April 27, 2005 and accepted public comment through May 1, 2005. On May 25, 2005, LMDC released a revised Funding Allocation Framework, which then served as the basis for allocating remaining CDBG funds. The Funding Allocation Framework can be viewed at the LMDC website at www.renenwyc.com in the Funding Initiatives section. In 2006, LMDC issued a Final Action Plan regarding the unallocated portion of the \$2 billion federal appropriation at that time, which has since been amended to reflect subsequent developments.

Historically, LMDC also gathered public input through its Funding Application Process. That process allowed members of the public, through their funding proposals and any subsequent meetings with LMDC staff, to articulate their perceptions of, and solutions to, the diverse needs of Lower Manhattan.

The LMDC website has been available for the public to provide feedback on a variety of topics related to the redevelopment of WTC Site, the revitalization of Lower Manhattan’s neighborhoods, and LMDC Partial Action Plans. To date, LMDC has received thousands of comments through its website.

I. World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program

A. Needs and Objective

On September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks killed 2,749 people and destroyed every structure on the WTC site, including the Twin Towers, commercial and governmental low-rise buildings, the hotel, the underground concourse, the PATH terminal, and subway stations. The structures on the Southern Site, adjacent to the WTC site, were also destroyed or damaged by the events of September 11th: the office tower at 130 Liberty Street was severely damaged, could not be reoccupied, and the St. Nicholas Church at 155 Cedar Street was also destroyed.

While the WTC Site was closed to the public, a wide sidewalk and viewing area with a commemorative viewing wall had been created along the east side of the site on Church Street and the portion of Liberty Street (between the WTC Site and the Southern Site) was open to pedestrians from Church Street to the temporary bridge over West Street to Battery Park City. The WTC site has since re-opened featuring the WTC Memorial and the WTC Memorial Museum along with occupied commercial towers at One WTC and 4 WTC.

B. Background

The significant loss of life, jobs, and commercial space affected the vitality of Lower Manhattan and continues to pose a threat to the financial, emotional, and cultural vitality of the neighborhood. The Memorial and Cultural Program helps to counter the blighting effect of the events of September 11, 2001, and to provides a permanent memorial for current and future generations to remember and honor the nearly 3,000 people who died on that day in New York City, in Shanksville, Pennsylvania, and at the Pentagon, as well as those who died in the terrorist bombing at the WTC on February 26, 1993. The project restored the WTC Site, repairing the underlying fabric of Lower Manhattan, and helps foster the growth of Lower Manhattan as a vibrant cultural and financial district.

The culmination of LMDC's planning efforts for the redevelopment of the WTC area is the World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan (WTC Plan), developed in cooperation with The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (Port Authority), the owner of the WTC site. As part of the WTC Plan, LMDC proposed to implement new memorial and cultural uses, including the Memorial and Memorial Museum, as outlined in LMDC's General Project Plan (GPP), as amended. LMDC undertook an extensive public process over two years to develop the WTC Plan and other initiatives. The following is an overview of the components of this process.

Principles and Preliminary Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan

The Preliminary Blueprint and Principles laid groundwork for LMDC rebuilding and revitalization efforts. The Preliminary Blueprint proposed goals and objectives as well as actions to realize those goals. Denoting its importance, creation of a fitting memorial was the first goal in the Preliminary Blueprint: "Respect the site of the World Trade Center as a place of remembrance, and reserve an area of the site for one or more permanent memorials." It goes on to affirm that: "A sacred, respectful memorial must be erected to honor the thousands who perished and the emergency responders who gave their lives in the line of duty." The Preliminary Blueprint and Principles may be viewed on LMDC's website at <http://www.renewnyc.com/content/pdfs/PrinciplesBlueprint071102.pdf>.

Preliminary Design Concepts

In July 2002, LMDC and Port Authority released six design concepts for the WTC site. These designs sparked a public debate, beginning with "Listening to the City," a town hall forum attended by over 4,000 interested individuals. Through this public forum, LMDC was able to enrich and refine its planning goals. LMDC continued this public dialogue by convening meetings with its Advisory Councils and by conducting public meetings in each of the five boroughs of New York City and in New Jersey. An exhibit of the six design concepts was displayed at historic Federal Hall in Lower Manhattan, which drew over 17,000 visitors. Comment cards were distributed to visitors to allow them to provide feedback. The results of this public dialogue led to the next phase of the planning process, the Innovative Design Study.

Innovative Design Study

In fall of 2002, LMDC launched an international design competition for innovative land use plan for the WTC site. Seven teams were selected out of 406 submissions. The teams were guided by the Innovative Design Study Program, which called for a fitting setting for the memorial, a distinctive skyline, mixed uses on the site, and enhanced transportation. After the release of the seven plans on December 18, 2002, LMDC embarked on Plans in Progress, an extensive public outreach campaign that again brought the public into the planning process. The outreach initiative involved an exhibition of the seven site plans at the World Financial Center Winter Garden that drew over 100,000 visitors, the distribution and collection of comment cards next to the exhibition, and a documentary of the seven teams each describing its design which was disseminated to every public library in New York City. Presentations of the seven designs and comments submitted could be viewed on the LMDC website. In addition, LMDC held a public hearing, which was simulcast in all five boroughs and Long Island, and a separate hearing in New Jersey. In total, the outreach campaign yielded over 13,000 comments.

On February 27, 2003, then Governor George E. Pataki and Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg announced the selection of Memory Foundations by Studio Daniel Libeskind LLC as the design for the WTC site. Studio Daniel Libeskind is responsible for the master plan and design guidelines for the site. A significant part of Studio Daniel Libeskind's work was the planning of an integrated memorial and cultural district that could accommodate the selected memorial design. Design concepts for Memory Foundations included the exposure of the slurry wall, the development of a memorial and cultural district adjacent to the slurry wall, and the creation of a 1,776-foot tall building that would restore the majestic skyline.

Master Planning Phase

In September 2003, LMDC, Port Authority, and Daniel Libeskind presented a revised master plan. The revised site plan enhanced the key design principles by relocating portions of commercial space off the WTC site, providing for park space in the area south of Liberty Street, and placing truck and bus-servicing infrastructure away from the memorial area. Memory Foundations included what had been called the "Freedom Tower", now known as One World Trade Center, which opened on November 3, 2014. This soaring tower contains 2.6 million square feet of office space, retail, rooftop restaurant, and an observation deck. The building includes state of the art security technology including extra fireproofing, structural redundancy, and chemical and biological filters for the air supply.

Environmental Review of the Redevelopment of the World Trade Center Site

An important step in the development of a comprehensive strategic plan is environmental review. The WTC Plan includes construction of a Memorial, Memorial Center, and memorial-related improvements, as well as commercial, retail, museum and cultural facilities, new open space areas, new street configurations, and infrastructure improvements at the WTC site and at certain adjacent sites to the south. LMDC conducted a coordinated environmental review of the WTC Plan, pursuant to federal statute, as the recipient of HUD Community Development Block Grant program funds (42 USC § 5304(g)) and as lead agency under both the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) and the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) and its implementing regulations (6 NYCRR Part 617). That review culminated in a Draft and Final Generic Environmental Impact Statement (GEIS).

LMDC began the environmental review with a Draft Scope for the GEIS that was reviewed at two public scoping meetings held at the Tribeca Performing Arts Center at the Borough of Manhattan Community College in July 2003. Public comments on the Draft Scope were received at the scoping meeting and in writing until August 4, 2003. LMDC addressed these comments in the Final Scope issued in September 2003.

In January 2004, the LMDC Board approved the Draft GEIS and it was released for public comment until March 15, 2004. Public hearings were held to solicit comment on the plan and the Draft GEIS at Pace University on February 18, 2004.

On April 13, 2004, the LMDC Board approved the Final GEIS. On June 2, 2004, LMDC issued a Record of Decision and Findings Statement (ROD), concluding the environmental review process. On April 1, 2005, LMDC completed a supplemental Environmental Assessment of Proposed Refinements to the WTC Plan (EA) and a finding of no significant impact (FONSI) beyond those disclosed in the FGEIS. Public comments were received on the EA and FONSI through May 6, 2005. Additional analyses were performed in 2006 in connection with further refinements resulting in a second EA and FONSI released for public comment on September 7, 2006. That FONSI was confirmed on October 12, 2006. The Final GEIS, the ROD, the 2005 and 2006 EAs and FONSIs, and other environmental documents are available on LMDC's website at http://renewnyc.com/plan_des_dev/environmental_review.asp.

Memorial Mission Statement and Program

LMDC made an early commitment to the establishment of a fitting memorial to honor those killed in the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001 and on February 26, 1993, as well as to recognize the outpouring of emotion, material and financial support provided by businesses, government agencies, nonprofit organizations, and individuals in response to the attacks. To guide the development of a memorial, LMDC developed a clearly defined process that was closely coordinated with the planning and redevelopment of the WTC site. Two major components of the process were the creations of a memorial mission statement and a memorial program. The LMDC Families Advisory Council developed the preliminary draft mission statement and program in the summer of 2002. The draft mission statement described the purpose of the memorial, while the program described the principles that the memorial must embody and the elements it must feature to be considered in the memorial competition.

The draft mission statement and program were released for public comment from January 8, 2003 through February 2, 2003. LMDC convened meetings of its Advisory Councils to discuss the draft mission statement and program, and held a public hearing in Lower Manhattan on January 14, 2003 that was simulcast to every borough of New York City and to Long Island. Comments were also received on the LMDC website. By the end of the comment period, LMDC received over 2,000 comments. LMDC convened two separate committees, comprised of family members, residents, survivors, first responders, arts and architecture professionals and community leaders, which revised the mission statement and the program to incorporate the public comments. The final memorial mission statement and program are viewable on the LMDC's website at <http://renewnyc.com/Memorial/memmission.asp>.

Memorial Competition

In April 2003, LMDC launched the worldwide World Trade Center Site Memorial Competition to design the memorial at the WTC site. LMDC received 5,201 memorial design submissions from 63 nations and 49 states making it the largest design competition in history. In November 2003, LMDC unveiled eight finalist designs. Images of three-dimensional models of the finalists' designs, as well as images of all the submissions are viewable on the Memorial Competition website: <http://www.wtcsitememorial.org/>.

On January 6, 2004, the thirteen-member World Trade Center Site Memorial jury announced the winner of the memorial design competition, Reflecting Absence, by architect Michael Arad and landscape architect Peter Walker. On January 14, 2004, Arad and Walker presented a refined memorial design. The design proposes a space that conveys the feelings of loss caused by the destruction of the WTC and the death of thousands of individuals on September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993. The design features reflecting pools within sunken voids that encompass the footprints of the Twin Towers within a grove of trees and provides a final resting place for the unidentified remains of those killed in the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993.

Memorial Museum Recommendations

LMDC and Studio Daniel Libeskind, working in collaboration with Michael Arad and Peter Walker, established the location for a below grade Memorial Center (now the Memorial Museum) dedicated to the events of September 11, 2001, and February 26, 1993. On April 8, 2004, LMDC announced the formation of a Memorial Center Advisory Committee to make recommendations for the development of program elements and the curatorial mission of the Memorial Museum at the World Trade Center Site. The Advisory Committee included historians, preservationists, curators, victims' family members, residents, survivors, and first responders.

LMDC released the Advisory Committee's draft recommendations, and public comments on these recommendations were accepted through July 1, 2004. The recommendations were that the Memorial Museum be integrated into the memorial/cultural complex and tell the countless individual and collective stories of the terrorist attacks on February 26, 1993 and September 11, 2001. It will honor those individuals who lost their lives in the attacks and recognize the acts of heroism that arose from these tragedies. Programming will include, among other elements, the display and preservation of artifacts from the WTC site. The Memorial Museum seeks to (1) Educate and inform by telling stories of the victims of the terrorist attacks on February 26, 1993 and September 11, 2001, and of the rescue, recovery, and revitalization efforts; and (2) Convey these stories in a broader social, economic, and political context.

Cultural Institutions

LMDC issued an Invitation to Cultural Institutions on June 30, 2003 to solicit information from cultural institutions and organizations interested in locating on or participating in cultural programming at the WTC site. Cultural institutions and organizations would contribute energy and diversity to Lower Manhattan while establishing it as a cultural hub. The inclusion of culture was intended to celebrate life and provide a fitting environment for remembrance. LMDC received 113 expressions of interest.

LMDC established criteria for the cultural institutions to be located on the WTC site, including: celebration of life while providing an appropriate setting for remembrance; creation of a critical mass of opportunities to improve the quality of life in Lower Manhattan; a diverse range of cultural programs for residents and businesses; and the potential for contributing to the economic development of the WTC site and New York City.

On June 10, 2004, LMDC announced the tentative selection of a vibrant mix of institutions intended to be located on the WTC site. On May 19, 2005, the schematic design for the WTC Cultural Center was unveiled. For a variety of reasons some of those institutions are no longer planning to participate.

The Joyce Theater worked closely with LMDC to conduct detailed feasibility analyses of their proposed programming, funding capacity, and space requirements. The Joyce Theater Foundation's International Dance Center was offered space on the site and intends to present its own programming at the future WTC Performing Arts Center as well as host other events and organizations such as the Tribeca Film Festival and the Orpheus Chamber Ensemble.

Performance spaces, screening rooms, galleries, education programs, and rehearsal spaces are expected to be made available for community and cultural uses. While cultural programming decisions continued to be analyzed, LMDC and the City of New York have been working on the conceptual development of a Performing Arts Center at the World Trade Center. This work has focused on a design that would include a theater for dance, a black box theater, substantial rehearsal space, and a small cabaret/entertainment space. Performing Arts Center funding is also available in partial action plans 11 and S-2.

The National September 11 Memorial and Museum at the World Trade Center Foundation, Inc. (Formerly the World Trade Center Memorial Foundation, Inc.)

On December 1, 2004, Governor George E. Pataki and Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg announced the Board of Directors for The National September 11 Memorial and Museum at the World Trade Center Foundation, Inc. (Foundation), composed of civic and business leaders, leading philanthropists, statesmen, and victims' family members from around the World. In addition, Presidents Gerald Ford, Jimmy Carter, George H.W. Bush, and William J. Clinton agreed to serve as Honorary Members and pledged their support for the Foundation. The Foundation has undertaken coordination of funding and construction of the Memorial and the Memorial Museum that will preserve artifacts from the attacks and convey individual stories of lives lost. Originally named the World Trade Center Memorial Foundation, Inc., the organization changed its name in 2008. For more information regarding the Foundation, please visit the website at: www.national911memorial.org.

C. World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program – Breakdown of Activities

LMDC will implement the General Project Plan for the World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program, as amended February 14, 2007 (GPP), in cooperation with Port Authority as part of the implementation of the WTC Plan. As set forth in the GPP, the Memorial and Cultural Program is LMDC's responsibility and includes the planning, selection, coordination and construction of a Memorial and Memorial Museum, the planning and possible construction of memorial-related improvements, and the coordination of cultural uses on the WTC site to complement the redevelopment of commercial office space, retail space, conference center and hotel facilities, open space areas, and certain infrastructure improvements by the Port Authority. At the same time, the Port Authority will be responsible for the commercial, retail, conference center and hotel facilities, open space areas, and infrastructure components of the WTC Plan. LMDC and the Port Authority will coordinate the real estate transactions necessary to realize the WTC Plan. As noted above, LMDC conducted the environmental review of the WTC Plan.

Project Area

The project area is located in Lower Manhattan on two sites: (1) the WTC site, bounded by West, Vesey, Church, and Liberty Streets; and (2) a series of adjacent parcels immediately to the south of the WTC site, comprising (a) two city blocks, one bounded by Liberty, Washington, Albany and Greenwich Streets, and the other bounded by Liberty, West, Cedar and Washington Streets, (b) subsurface portions of two streets: Liberty Street between those blocks and the WTC site and from the eastern side of West Street to the western side of Greenwich Street, (c) Washington Street between from the northern side of Cedar Street and to the southern side of Liberty Streets, and (d) subsurface portions of Cedar Street from the eastern side of West Street to the eastern side of Washington Street (collectively, the Southern Site). The Southern Site includes those properties commonly known as 130 Liberty Street, 140 Liberty Street, and 155 Cedar Street.

Project Objectives

The rebuilding of the Project Area as a mixed-use center of commerce, public spaces, and culture, with the Memorial at its heart, has and will continue to advance the goals of the UDC Act, the objectives developed by LMDC, and the goals articulated by the Governor of the State of New York and the Mayor of The City of New York—to remember and honor the victims of the September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 terrorist attacks while revitalizing Lower Manhattan.

Remembering the Victims of the Terrorist Attacks

The Memorial opened to the public on September 11, 2011. The Memorial ensures that future generations never forget the thousands of people who died on September 11, 2001 in New York, in Shanksville, Pennsylvania and at the Pentagon in Virginia, as well as those who died in the terrorist bombing of the World Trade Center on February 26, 1993. The Memorial is set in a context that bustles with the activity of Lower Manhattan, yet provides a quiet and respectful setting for remembrance and contemplation. Family members of victims and visitors from around the world come to the Project Area to learn about the events of September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 and to remember those who died and those whose lives were changed forever.

Revitalizing Lower Manhattan

The conditions of the Project Area were “substandard and insanitary” under the UDC Act and impaired the sound growth and development of Lower Manhattan. In addition, there was a need for the development of cultural, recreational, community and other civic facilities in Lower Manhattan.

Restoring the Project Area as a functioning part of Lower Manhattan has been the primary objective. The project has and will continue to eliminate the blighting effects resulting from the events of September 11, 2001, and reestablish the Project Area as a locus of commerce, civic space and amenities, including appropriate commercial and retail uses, as well as supporting facilities, utilities and infrastructure. While Lower Manhattan is a center of world finance and a major economic engine for the entire region, it has also become the fastest growing residential neighborhood and a major destination of regional, national, and international travelers. For these reasons, revitalization of Lower Manhattan should include cultural and other amenities that help make the area a lively environment all day, every day.

The presence of an essentially empty, excavated space in the heart of New York’s financial district was a blight that made the area less attractive for businesses, residents and visitors. It was important to New York City’s economy that, as business leases in Lower Manhattan came up for renewal, businesses had confidence that the Project Area was being redeveloped as quickly as possible to reduce its blighting effect on the immediate area. Similarly, it was and remains important to the stability of the residential community in Lower Manhattan that residents have confidence in the rebuilding and remain in the area. As previously noted, the Memorial opened to the public in September 2011 and the Memorial Museum opened to the public in May 2014. Although not directly funded by LMDC, the WTC site consists of several new office towers. WTC 1 and 4 are completed and include 5.34 million rentable square feet of technologically advanced office space, of which over 60% was leased as of the second quarter of 2015. Following are specific activities that will be undertaken as part of the Memorial and Cultural Program:

1. World Trade Center Memorial and Memorial Museum

As discussed in detail in the Background section above, LMDC, in carrying out the Memorial and Cultural Program, conducted an international competition for the selection of the Memorial design and engaged in a broad spectrum of activities related to the planning, design, and implementation of the Memorial and Memorial Museum (together, Memorial/Museum). These activities specifically related to the Memorial/Museum and were critical with respect to the overall planning process that led to the comprehensive WTC Plan. LMDC provided initial funding for the design, development, and construction of the Memorial and planned for the overall implementation of the Memorial/Museum and elements of the WTC Plan, including all required coordination with HUD, the Port Authority, the State of New York, The City of New York, and other public and private entities. LMDC also coordinated the Memorial Program with the plans and implementation schedule for the WTC Plan. Associated costs include planning and design, public outreach, environmental review, consultant costs, and staff costs associated with these functions. Construction of the Memorial/Museum was carried out by the Foundation in accordance with the WTC Plan and a subrecipient agreement with LMDC.

Beneficiaries

Thousands of relatives and friends of the nearly 3,000 victims of September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 have and will continue to benefit from the memorial to their loved ones. Others immediately affected by the events, including survivors, area residents, and workers benefit from the project. This project has and will continue to also benefit the thousands of visitors to the Memorial/Museum, which allows them to honor those who were killed in the attacks. The Memorial and Memorial Museum has and will continue to foster greater public awareness of the events of February 26, 1993 and September 11, 2001 and the impact on the victims’ families, survivors, area residents, New York City, and beyond.

Schedule

LMDC has carried out activities relating to the development and implementation of the WTC Plan, as detailed above in Section B – Background, since early 2002. Implementation of the WTC Plan began in 2004 and will extend through 2020. The Memorial and Cultural Program portion of the plan, specifically the Memorial/Museum, began in 2004 and was completed in 2014.

Federal and Other Resources

The Memorial/Museum was funded with a combination of public investments and private funds donated by individuals and groups to the Foundation. The Foundation also uses its own resources to engage in fundraising for both public sector and private sector funds, as well as individual donations.

Total Estimated Cost

The total allocation for this activity was up to \$64,525,972 which has been fully expended. This allocation had changed as follows:

Date	(\$ Allocation)
Original Partial Action Plan 11/2004	34,980,000
Amendment 10/2005	48,580,000
Amendment 12/2006	62,875,000
Amendment 05/2010	64,525,972

Original Partial Action Plan (November 2004): The original Partial Action Plan provided for Memorial/Museum costs that were part of the preparation and development of the WTC Plan, including planning, design competitions, environmental review, public outreach activities, and staff time. These costs were identified as critical to the planning, design, and preliminary implementation of the Memorial and Cultural Program. The original Partial Action Plan also funded activities such as pre-design engineering, schematic design, design development, cost estimating and coordination for the construction. This funding provided for planning of memorial-related improvements on the WTC site and adjacent areas to complement the redevelopment of commercial office space, retail space, conference center and hotel facilities, open space areas, infrastructure improvements, and public outreach efforts.

October 2005 Amendment to Partial Action Plan: This amendment provided additional funds for the planning, development, and preliminary implementation costs of the Memorial/Museum. The additional costs included continuation of design through design development, construction documents, and construction administration. The funds also covered sustainability and security consultants, public outreach, environmental review, institutional planning, conservation research, and registrar consultants.

December 2006 Amendment to Partial Action Plan: This amendment eliminated certain funding for activities prior to 2004 because planning and administration funds remained available to fund these costs. The amendment also provided additional funds for the design and construction of the Memorial/Museum.

May 2010 Amendment to Partial Action Plan: This amendment provided additional funds for Museum exhibits which presents key aspects of the history of the events following September 11th.

Additional World Trade Center Memorial and Memorial Museum funding has been made available in Partial Action Plans 11, 12, S-2 and the Final Action Plan.

**2. World Trade Center Memorial Program Income
(National September 11 Memorial and Museum at the World Trade Center Foundation, Inc.)**

As discussed above, the Foundation undertook coordination, planning, and administrative activities leading to the construction of the Memorial/Museum. LMDC has and will continue to allocate income from license fees to the Foundation to support the Foundation's ability to carry out these activities. This funding will only be used by the Foundation to carry-out HUD eligible activities. Licensing fees are expected to be received from publishers and others who make authorized use of images and other copyrighted materials that were created as part of the development of the Memorial and Cultural Program.

Beneficiaries

Thousands of relatives and friends of the nearly 3,000 victims of September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 have and will continue to benefit from the memorial to their loved ones. Others immediately affected by the events, including survivors, and area residents and workers have and will continue to benefit from the project. This project has and will continue to benefit millions of visitors to the site by fostering greater public awareness of the attacks on September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 while having an even greater impact on the victims' families, survivors, area residents, New York City, and possibly beyond. Now, a world-class cultural destination, this project has and will continue to also benefit businesses, workers, residents, and visitors throughout Lower Manhattan.

Schedule

The implementation of the WTC Plan began in 2004 and will extend through 2020. The Memorial and Cultural Program portion of the WTC Plan, specifically the Memorial/Museum, began in 2004 and was completed in 2014. The Foundation's activities will extend beyond the full implementation of the WTC Plan.

Federal and Other Resources

The memorial and cultural institutions have and will continue to be funded with a combination of private funds donated by individuals and groups to the Foundation, public investment, and investment that will be made by cultural institutions located on the site. The Foundation will use its own resources to engage in fundraising for both public sector and private sector funds to accomplish its ongoing mission. Coordination, planning, and administrative activities will partly be funded through licensing fees expected to be received from publishers and others who make authorized use of images and other copyrighted materials that were created as part of the development of the Memorial and Cultural Program LMDC activities. These fees are considered Program Income, meaning that the income was earned as a result of LMDC / HUD grant-supported activities such as the Innovative Design Study and the Master Planning efforts. This Program Income will be added to the total funds committed to LMDC's HUD grant without an allocation being made from LMDC's \$2.78 billion in Community Development Block Grant funds for this activity.

Total Estimated Cost

The total estimated cost for the allocation of license fees to the Foundation for coordination, planning, and administrative activities is up to \$1,000,000. These license fees are program income and as a result this plan makes no allocation from LMDC’s \$2.78 billion in Community Development Block Grant funds for this activity.

3. World Trade Center Performing Arts Center

As discussed above, cultural uses on the rebuilt WTC site will provide a variety of important uses as part of the overall redevelopment plan. The cultural components will help create a world class visitor destination that will contribute to the economic development of the site and the area while improving the quality of life for those who live and work in Lower Manhattan. Programming is anticipated to be broad and diverse, and will serve both businesses and residents.

As cultural programming decisions continued to be analyzed, LMDC and the City of New York have been working on the conceptual development of a Performing Arts Center at the World Trade Center. This work has focused on infrastructure planning for a design that would include a theater for dance, a black box theater, substantial rehearsal space, and possibly a small cabaret/entertainment space. Performing Arts Center funding is also available in partial action plans 11 and S-2.

Public space and activities that will be part of the Performing Arts Center could include educational programs for school groups, community workshops, open rehearsals, and a forum for lunchtime and evening activities such as staged readings, lectures, and demonstrations.

Beneficiaries

Those immediately affected by the events, including survivors, area residents and workers, will equally benefit from the project. This project will also benefit businesses, workers, residents, and visitors throughout Lower Manhattan and will contribute to the overall economic recovery of Lower Manhattan and New York City.

Schedule

The implementation of the WTC Plan began in 2004 and will extend through 2020. The Memorial and Cultural Program portion of the redevelopment plan began in 2004 and will extend through 2018, including the planning, design, and development of a Performing Arts Center. Specific activities outlined in this Partial Action Plan began in 2004 with all allocated funds expended by 2015.

Federal and Other Resources

The memorial and cultural institutions will be funded with a combination of private funds donated by individuals and groups to the Foundation, public investment, and investment that will be made by the cultural institutions that locate on the site.

Total Estimated Cost

The total estimated cost for this activity is \$11,004,000 which has been spent in full:

Date	(\$) Allocation
Original Partial Action Plan 11/2004	12,260,000
Amendment 10/2005	16,360,000
Amendment 12/2006	11,004,000

Original Partial Action Plan (November 2004). The original Partial Action Plan provided for Performing Arts Center costs that were part of the preparation and development of the WTC Plan, including planning, design competitions, environmental review, public outreach activities, and staff time. These costs were identified as critical to the planning, design, and preliminary implementation of the Memorial and Cultural Program. The original Partial Action Plan also funded planning, schematic design, and coordination activities for the performing arts center which included development of initial business and other institutional plans by selected cultural institutions and an initial business plan for the joint operation of the performing arts facilities; development of detailed program requirements for each cultural institution and for the shared spaces to be used in schematic design; and development of schematic designs for the performing arts facility. It also included pre-construction management services, sustainable design planning, financial and management consulting services, theatrical and other design consultants and cost estimators.

The October 2005 Partial Action Plan Amendment provided additional funds for the same planning, development, and preliminary implementation costs identified in the original Partial Action Plan.

The December 2006 Partial Action Plan Amendment eliminated certain funding for activities prior to 2004 because planning and administration funds remained available to fund these costs.

4. World Trade Center Memorial Museum Pavilion (Formerly World Trade Center Museum Complex or Visitor Orientation and Education Center)

The WTC Memorial Museum Pavilion (Memorial Pavilion) serves as a welcome center for visitors to the Memorial/Museum. It will house ticketing, security, screening, visitor services, orientation and educational exhibits and serves as the entrance to the Memorial Museum.

Beneficiaries

Those immediately affected by the events, including survivors, area residents and workers, have and will continue to equally benefit from the project. This project has and will also continue to benefit businesses, workers, residents, and visitors throughout Lower Manhattan and will continue to contribute to the overall economic recovery of Lower Manhattan and New York City.

Schedule

The implementation of the WTC Plan will begin in 2004 and will extend through 2020. The Memorial and Cultural Program portion of the redevelopment plan, specifically the Memorial Museum, began in 2004 and was completed in 2014.

Federal and Other Resources

The Memorial Museum including the Museum Pavilion has been funded with a combination of public investments and private funds donated by individuals and groups to the Foundation. The Foundation also uses its own resources to engage in fundraising for both public sector and private sector funds, as well as individual donations. In addition to funding provided by this Partial Action Plan, the Museum Pavilion was funded through \$80,000,000 provided by the State of New York.

Total Estimated Cost

The total allocation of LMDC HUD funds to this activity was \$9,521,000. The total cost for this activity was \$89,521,000 (including \$80 million from New York State). This activity has been completed. The table below summarizes the federal funding allocation:

Date	(\$ Allocation)
Original Partial Action Plan 11/2004	9,260,000
Amendment 10/2005	33,460,000
Amendment 12/2006	9,521,000
Amendment 05/2010	9,471,631

Original Partial Action Plan (November 2004). The original Partial Action Plan provided funding for a Museum Complex that was part of the WTC Plan, including planning, design, environmental review, public outreach activities, and staff time. These costs were identified as critical to the planning, design, and preliminary implementation of the Memorial and Cultural Program. The original Partial Action Plan also funded planning, schematic design, and coordination activities for the proposed Museum Complex which included development of initial plans by selected cultural institutions and an initial business plan for the joint operation of the museum facilities; development of detailed program requirements for each cultural institution and for the shared spaces to be used in schematic design; and development of schematic designs for the Museum Complex.

October 2005 Amendment to the Partial Action Plan: This amendment provided additional funds for the planning, development and preliminary implementation costs of a Museum Complex. These costs included the continuation of design through design development, construction documents, and construction administration. In addition funds were provided for sustainability and security consultants, public outreach, environmental review, consultant costs, and staff costs associated with these functions.

December 2006 Amendment to the Partial Action Plan: This amendment provided notice that the Museum Complex had been replaced in the WTC Plan with a Visitor Orientation and Education Center, later renamed the Memorial Museum Pavilion. This building serves as a welcome center for visitors to the Memorial/Museum. It houses ticketing, security, screening, visitor services, orientation and educational exhibits and serves as the entrance to the Memorial Museum. This amendment also reduced the allocation for this activity to \$9,521,000 to provide only for the initial planning of the Museum Complex and the efforts to convert the planned structure into the Museum Pavilion. These costs included pre-design engineering, schematic design, costs estimating, sustainability, public outreach, and environmental review consultants. Certain funding for activity prior to 2004 was also eliminated because planning and administration funds remained available to fund these costs.

May 2010 Amendment to the Partial Action Plan: This amendment further reduced the allocation for this activity to the exact amount expended for the planning of the Museum Complex and the efforts to convert the planned structure into the Memorial Museum.

II. Tribute in Light

Marking the six-month anniversary of the WTC tragedy, on March 11, 2002, two beams of light rose from a site just north of the WTC site into the night sky to honor those lost on September 11th and to celebrate the spirit of all the New Yorkers who have worked to rebuild and renew New York City. Conceived in the aftermath of September 11th, Tribute in Light is an artistic gesture bringing together the vision and talent of numerous individuals who, shortly after the attacks, independently envisioned two beams of light rising from downtown New York. Initially organized by the Municipal Art Society and Creative Time, Tribute in Light was conceived by team of architects John Bennett and Gustavo Bonevardi of PROUN Space Studio, artists Julian LaVerdiere and Paul Myoda, architect Richard Nash Gould, and lighting designer Paul Marantz. Under certain conditions, the Tribute in Light could be seen from up to 25 miles away in any direction.

Universally embraced by the public, Tribute in Light has returned for one night each year as part of the annual commemoration of the September 11th tragedies as a tribute to the memory of those lost and a symbol of the spirit of the City. The Municipal Art Society, as one of the founding organizers and sponsors of this installation, had worked in cooperation with The City of New York and sought support for the ongoing presentation of Tribute in Light. LMDC funds supported the purchase of lights as well as technical support and maintenance for the first five years of the annual memorial commemoration. Additional funds were allocated to support two additional years of the commemoration. Additional funding for Tribute in Light has also been provided in the Final Action Plan.

Project Area

Since September 11, 2004 the site for the annual commemoration has been the Battery Garage, which is owned by the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and sits about six blocks south of ground zero.

Project Objectives

Support of this installation is consistent with LMDC's mission to create a permanent memorial honoring those lost. It has provided a valuable public service in that its continuation will help ensure that on each anniversary of September 11, 2001, the thousands of people who were killed that day and the loss of the WTC and its impact on New York City and beyond will continue to be commemorated. In addition, the WTC Site Memorial Competition jury recommended, in their selection of Reflecting Absence as a permanent memorial on the WTC site, that provisions be made to accommodate the annual showing of Tribute in Light as part of the memorial experience. Prior to the completion of the permanent memorial, it served as an interim memorial to those who were killed on that day.

Beneficiaries

Thousands of relatives and friends of the nearly 3,000 victims of September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 have benefitted from the memorial to their loved ones. Others immediately affected by the events, including survivors and area residents and workers have also benefitted from the project. Those able to view Tribute in Light, even from miles away, have benefitted from its symbolic message of hope, uniting the families of those who lost loved ones, New Yorkers, the nation, and the world.

Schedule

LMDC funding was initially provided beginning in 2004 for a period of five years. This time period was subsequently extended to cover presentations through 2011.

Federal and Other Resources

In 2002 and 2003, Tribute in Light was funded through private contributions. This Partial Action Plan provided a total of \$3,695,000 for production costs from 2004 through 2011. LMDC HUD provided an additional \$145,000 through the Cultural and Community Events and Installations Program in the Final Action Plan and has subsequently provided funding for 2012 through 2014 also through the Final Action Plan. Certain administrative costs of the project were funded privately.

Total Estimated Cost

The total allocation of HUD funds through this Partial Action Plan was \$3,695,000 as shown below. This allocation of funds has been fully expended.

Date	(\$) Allocation
Original Partial Action Plan 11/2004	3,500,000
Amendment 12/2006	3,000,000
Amendment 05/2010	3,695,000

Original Partial Action Plan (November 2004): The original Partial Action Plan provided \$3,500,000 for purchase of lights and a five-year period of operation (2004-2008).

December 2006 Amendment: This amendment reduced LMDC funding for Tribute in Light by \$500,000 for the five years (2004-2008). This reduction was made as a result of cost reductions including savings from lower than expected bids for some items.

May 2010 Amendment: This amendment allocated an additional \$695,000 to provide funding for the presentations in 2010 and 2011.

III. StoryCorps WTC StoryBooth Project

StoryCorps was a national initiative to instruct and inspire Americans to record each other's stories in sound. This was initially achieved by collecting broadcast-quality oral history interviews with the guidance of a trained facilitator in a sound-proof booth. As part of StoryCorps, Sound Portraits Productions planned, installed, and operated a booth originally located at the WTC site (WTC StoryBooth) then moved, due to site construction, to Foley Square just north of the site. The WTC StoryBooth recorded precious bits of family history, memories, humorous tales, and other stories. StoryCorps reached out to family members of victims to record stories about their loved ones and to other visitors to the site, including area residents and survivors, to recount stories of September 11th as well as other experiences. At the end of a 40-minute session, participants walked away with a CD of their interview. With their permission, a copy was retained to be housed at the Library of Congress and an additional copy was made available for the Memorial Museum's permanent collection. The StoryCorps collection will continue to grow into an oral history of America.

Funding for this project included costs associated with the installation and operations through 2011.

Project Area

From 2005 to 2007 the WTC StoryBooth was located at the WTC site (near the PATH Station). The WTC StoryBooth was moved a few blocks north of the site to Foley Square in Lower Manhattan in 2008.

Project Objectives

The WTC site is visited by people from all over the world. Visitors and families of victims had expressed a need for opportunities to reflect, remember, and communicate in a structured environment before completion of the permanent memorial at the WTC site. The project was a means to involve victims' families and the public in communicating by collecting, preserving, and telling the complete stories of their loved ones and of the events.

This project provided a valuable public service, as it was not only essential to the healing process, but vital to curators, historians, academics and others that have been and will continue to be charged with interpreting the events of those attacks. The project served as an interim memorial through which family members, survivors, residents, and others affected by the events of September 11th shared their stories, grieved, and healed, until the permanent memorial was built. It also provided the public-at-large with a deeper understanding of the impact of the attacks and the lives lost so tragically until the permanent memorial was built. StoryCorps recordings have been added to the permanent collection of the Memorial Museum for ongoing use.

StoryCorps has provided over 1,300 interviews to the National 9/11 Memorial Museum's Collection, which includes both remembrances of the attacks of September 11, 2001, and February 23, 1993, and narratives of individuals' experiences on 9/11 in response to 9/11. StoryCorps remembrance recordings are widely used in the memorial exhibition, with more than 500 audio recordings from family, friends, and coworkers available on victims' touch table portfolios and more than 400 stories used for the individual profiles in the exhibition's inner chamber. StoryCorps narrative recordings are used in the Museum's historical exhibition.

It must be noted that visitors to the Memorial Museum may still record their stories or memories of loved ones at a self-guided recording booth or through an appointment with a Memorial Museum historian.

Beneficiaries

The thousands of victims' families and visitors from around the region, the United States, and the world benefitted from the StoryCorps project for the period of time before the completion of the permanent memorial. It gave family members, first responders, survivors, residents, and others who were affected by September 11, 2001 a chance to share their stories, and it helped provide a deeper understanding of the loss of life and the impact of the attacks for the public at large. Going forward, millions of visitors to the Memorial Museum will benefit from the StoryCorps project which is now a part the Memorial Museum's permanent collection.

Schedule

Development and implementation of the WTC StoryBooth began in 2004 with the StoryBooth opening in 2005. Funding was provided for operation through 2011.

Federal and Other Resources

This Partial Action Plan provided a total of up to \$900,000 for the WTC StoryBooth including \$400,000 from a Final Action Plan allocation/amendment in 2010. LMDC had provided an additional \$1,000,000 through the Cultural Enhancement Fund Program described in Partial Action Plan 11. The subrecipient responsible for this project, Sound Portrait Productions, had contributed over \$1,000,000 in privately raised funds to the installation and operation of the WTC StoryBooth. The project was completed with a residual balance of \$33,978.87 which has been returned to the Final Action Plan, the source of the project funding increase made in August 2010.

Total Estimated Cost

Date	(\$ Allocation)
Original Partial Action Plan 11/2004	500,000
05/2010 Amendment	900,000

Original Partial Action Plan (November 2004): The original Plan allocated \$500,000 for installation of the booth in 2004-2005 and one year of booth operations through the first quarter of 2006.

Amendment May 2010: This amendment provided an additional up to \$400,000 for booth operations in 2010 and 2011. Booth operations from 2006 through 2009 were funded through a \$1,000,000 grant from the Cultural Enhancement Fund Program described in Partial Action Plan 11.

Amendment December 2015: This amendment was simply to return the unused portion of the May 2010 allocation to the Final Action Plan since the project was completed for an amount less than originally anticipated. This technical amendment was made after the project was completed.

IV. Living Memorial Project

Originally conceived by September's Mission, a September 11th family organization, the Living Memorial Project was a set of information technology tools that sought to centrally archive and make accessible information related to those lost on September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993. Via this project, family members, friends, and children were able to provide material about their loved ones including photos, videos, letters, newspaper clippings chronicling the victim's life, letters, artwork, poetry, etc., ensuring the preservation of the memory of those lost. Over time, this collection of information continues to serve as a living memorial and a lasting repository documenting for all time the lives lost on these tragic days, with the potential to grow into other modules for other 9/11 constituencies. To ensure privacy, the Living Memorial Project allowed family members to restrict access to their loved one's library. The Living Memorial Project was a response to requests from several family groups for a means to tell the complete stories of their loved ones and of the events of September 11th to create connections among families, children and the public to promote learning and healing until a permanent memorial was built. As it is Internet accessible, it serves family members, survivors, and others who may not be physically able to visit the WTC site. It has preserved the memory of those lost and the historic circumstances surrounding the events. The Living Memorial Project has been linked to the Foundation's website, added to the Foundation's digital archive, and has become part of the Memorial Museum.

The Living Memorial has provided digital content (photographs, videos, documents, and the like) related to nearly one-third of the victims to the Museum's Collection, represented in more than 1,000 catalogued lots. Living Memorial materials are accessible to Museum visitors in the memorial exhibition, in the victim's interactive table portfolios. In addition, more than 500 portraits on the Wall of Faces are sourced from Living Memorial. Access to the Living Memorial website is made available to Museum visitors via computer kiosks in Foundation Hall.

Funding for this project included, but was not limited to, professional and technical services required to oversee and execute this project, technical architecture design, and the purchase of hardware and software to host the repository.

Project Area

The Living Memorial project incorporated internet technology and provided an opportunity for family members and others around the world to access information about the victims. The digital archive has become a repository for 9/11 related content provided by families, survivors, and other affected persons. Portions of the archive have been incorporated into the Museum on the World Trade Center site.

Project Objectives

The WTC site is visited by people from all over the world. Visitors and families of victims had expressed a need for opportunities to reflect, remember, and communicate in a structured environment before the permanent memorial at the WTC site was completed. This project was a means to involve victims' families, colleagues, and friends, as well as the public in communicating by collecting, preserving, and telling the complete stories of their loved ones lost on September 11th. It worked to create connections among families, children, and the public to promote learning and healing for the time period before permanent memorial was built. Portions of the archive have been incorporated into the Memorial Museum.

This project has provided a valuable public service and ultimately created a valuable research archive vital to curators, historians, academics, and others charged with interpreting the events of these attacks. It also has spoken to a greater public need to know more about the lives lost so tragically. Use of the Living Memorial Project has included incorporation into the Memorial Museum digital archive and core exhibition programs as part of the Memorial.

Beneficiaries

The thousands of victims' families and visitors from around the region, the United States, and the world have and will continue to benefit from the Living Memorial from the period of time before the completion of the permanent memorial and since the Memorial Museum was open to the public in May 2014. It has given family members, first responders, survivors, residents, and others who were affected by September 11th a chance to share their stories, and it will continue to provide a deeper understanding of the loss of life and the impact of the attacks for the public at large.

Schedule

Development and implementation began in 2004. The funding for the project extended through 2012.

Total Estimated Cost

The total estimated cost for the Living Memorial was approximately \$1.2 million of which LMDC provided funding of \$296,900.

V. Lower Manhattan Tourism - River to River Festival 2004 and 2005

The River to River Festival (Festival) was launched in 2002 by the Alliance for Downtown New York (Downtown Alliance) and major arts organizations and event producers. It was the largest free cultural arts festival in New York's history. The Festival successfully attracted new and diverse audiences to the downtown area who not only enjoyed the free arts events, but also stayed to experience Lower Manhattan's rich history, retail shops, and restaurants. The Festival drew over one million people per year to Lower Manhattan.

The Festival was comprised of more than 500 events that took place throughout Lower Manhattan from May through September. Free public events included a diversity of music, dance, and other cultural activities. LMDC funding provided prominent sponsorship for the Festival, which resulted in an LMDC presence at the events, where information on the rebuilding and revitalization efforts was disseminated to thousands of attendees. This commitment from LMDC allowed the Festival to deliver the summer-long, high-impact communications platform, supporting the costs associated with delivering the Festival's mission of presenting free, world-class summer programming in Lower Manhattan as an economic driver for the community. LMDC sponsorship included all the appropriate rights and benefits afforded this high level of support, including superior visual credit with logo on signage, banners, and posters; logo on full season's ads (NY Times, TimeOut NY, NY Post, etc.) on a rotating basis and on small format ads; LMDC's ID prominently presented on radio and TV promotional spots; LMDC's stand-alone logo on Festival street lamp banners in Lower Manhattan; LMDC's on-site display at 20 events/major venues; high profile visibility in announcement or launch events; VIP seating at select events; and enhanced website presence.

In 2005 LMDC also provided \$300,000 devoted specifically to the creation of a series presenting the four cultural institutions that had been selected to be located at the WTC site. This sponsorship allowed the Festival to produce high profile special events with the four cultural institutions, and provided funding for concept and program development and overall production management and execution. This series generated both public and media interest in the missions and programs of the cultural institutions, and shed light on their selection for relocation to Lower Manhattan and the WTC. The Festival also provided a platform whereby the institutions attracted new audiences and sources of financial support critical for the success of their expanded programming and facilities. Funds for this cultural institutions series covered programming for each institution at cost. The cultural institutions made in-kind donations of their staff time in return for their participation and exposure in the Festival.

In 2005, various programs were under consideration by the cultural institutions. These included, but were not limited to, the following:

- **Joyce Theater / Dance:** Interactive public dance programs exploring different genres of social dance linking performances by professional dance companies to public instruction and participation.
- **International Freedom Center / Film and Speech:** Public programming explored and celebrated heroes and freedom fighters. Pre- or post-performance dialogues invited the public to interact with writers, politicians, and other intellectual personalities whose work was directly related to the film topics.
- **Signature Theatre / Multi-Disciplinary Performing Arts:** Public programming included performances and conversations featuring playwrights as artists in other realms (film, music, etc.)
- **The Drawing Center / Visual Art:** Public programming included their creation of a temporary, site-specific installation by Drawing Center artists, functioning as a venue for interactive outreach programs.

Project Area

River to River events were held at various venues throughout Lower Manhattan for the four-month duration of the festival.

Project Objectives

The Festival was created to help revitalize Lower Manhattan by providing arts and cultural events to those who live, work, and visit Lower Manhattan. It also attracted thousands of visitors to the area, who then stayed to eat, shop, and explore other area venues. Based on the Festival's survey results, 46% of the audience attended a downtown cultural event for the first time, and 68% of attendees not living or working downtown stayed to dine, shop, or sightsee. 86% of those surveyed said that River to River contributed to downtown's recovery.

Beneficiaries

The Festival benefitted those who live, work, and visit Lower Manhattan by providing free public events. It had a positive impact on the businesses in the area by drawing more than three million people to festival venues and to Lower Manhattan during its first three years of existence.

Schedule

The Festival took place in 2004 and 2005 from June through September.

Federal and Other Resources

The Festival benefitted from a variety of private and public sponsors, including American Express, PACE University, Con Edison, GMC, WNYC, NBC Channel 4, Marriott, Century 21, J&R Music World, Starbucks Coffee, and others. The Festival's total budget for 2004 and 2005 was over \$14 million, of which sponsorships, partners, and in-kind funding provided approximately \$12 million.

Total Estimated Cost

Date	(\$ Allocation)
Original Partial Action Plan 11/2004	200,000
05/2010 Amendment	700,000

The Original Partial Action Plan allocated \$200,000 for the 2004 Festival.

October 2005 Amendment: This amendment provided an additional \$500,000 for the 2005 Festival.

VI. Planning and Administration

LMDC engages in broad planning and administration activities relating to the recovery, remembrance, and rebuilding efforts in Lower Manhattan, defined by LMDC as the entire area of Manhattan on or south of Houston Street.

As outlined in this Partial Action Plan, LMDC's planning activities began with the site planning for the WTC site and the areas immediately surrounding the site. The agency's off-site planning activities included the other neighborhoods in Lower Manhattan that have been affected by September 11th and its aftermath. Specifically, LMDC's planning activities included analyses of Lower Manhattan's transportation, traffic, housing and related amenities, open space, and economic development capacity, needs, and potential. Based on the results of these analyses, LMDC continued to develop and propose concept plans for specific areas and projects in Lower Manhattan.

LMDC's administrative activities included and will continue to include extensive public information and coordination activities relating to its LMDC planning work. As part of its coordination activities, LMDC serves as a facilitator of outreach and discussions between affected communities as well as the public at large and government agencies and officials. LMDC's public information work will continue to include large-scale public meetings and hearings; periodic printed newsletters, as warranted, and reports; an up-to-date, comprehensive, and interactive web site (www.RenewNYC.com); electronic communications; and other public outreach and participation efforts. In addition, LMDC continues to maintain its network of community contacts.

HUD has authorized the use of up to 5% of the total CDBG allocation to LMDC for costs associated with planning and administration activities, including costs for overhead, personnel, and consultants. The Original Partial Action Plan allocated \$3,262,994.74 towards LMDC's planning and administrative activities. The 10/2005 amendment provided an additional \$2,231,578.95, increasing the total amount allocated for planning and administrative activities to \$5,494,573.69.

VII. Response to Public Comment on the Original Partial Action Plan

This section addresses the comments received from the public following the release of the original proposed Partial Action Plan 8, from August 10, 2004 to September 8, 2004. The following section details the forty-three comments received and responses to those comments.

Comments on the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program

LMDC received forty-two similar comments from individuals and organizations that supported the continued development of the cultural components at the WTC site. However, the letters also expressed concern that LMDC had not addressed community development projects that were submitted by local community and cultural organizations. These letters called on the LMDC board to designate CDBG monies for these community-based organizations.

LMDC remains committed to fulfilling its mission in an open and inclusive manner. Since its inception in late 2001, LMDC has placed high priority on involving the public—victims' families, business owners, downtown residents, elected officials, and other community stakeholders—in the rebuilding of the WTC site and the overall revitalization of Lower Manhattan. In so doing, LMDC has completed many initiatives, both on the WTC site and throughout Lower Manhattan communities.

LMDC has implemented a number of off-site Lower Manhattan community initiatives, including the Residential Grant Program for Lower Manhattan residents, in recognition of the personal, family, and living expenses that were incurred as a result of the attacks on the WTC. In addition, LMDC worked in cooperation with ESDC and allocated funds for the recovery and revitalization of downtown's small and large businesses, which are crucial to Lower Manhattan's redevelopment. LMDC has also supported various tourism related initiatives, recognizing that tourism is a key and sustainable economic driver for Lower Manhattan's diverse residents and businesses. These tourism activities included the Chinatown Tourism and Marketing Campaign, the History and Heritage Campaign, and the Tribeca Film Festival, among others.

Similarly, LMDC, in consultation with participants from community groups, local businesses, and city and state government agencies, allocated funds for short-term capital projects designed to benefit residents, businesses, workers, students and visitors. These short-term capital projects included, but were not limited to, the Downtown Alliance Streetscape Program, Hudson River Park improvements, Millennium High School, and enhanced pedestrian access across West Street. LMDC had also allocated funds for the rehabilitation of 14 parks projects through May 2010, by the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, throughout Lower Manhattan's communities. The number of parks' rehabilitation projects LMDC has funded has grown to over 30 through December 2015.

LMDC has also engaged in long-term planning activities that has enhanced Lower Manhattan as a premiere location to live, work, and visit. Among LMDC's long-term planning activities were the Chinatown Access and Circulation Study, the Fulton Street Corridor Planning Study, the Airport Access and Circulation Study, and the East River Planning Studies and Improvements. All of the previously discussed LMDC initiatives, and others, are available for viewing on LMDC's website at www.renewnyc.com.

As LMDC moves forward with the allocation of the remaining CDBG funds, it will continue to actively gather input from community stakeholders on the redevelopment of Lower Manhattan. Requests for the remaining CDBG funds are constant and various community groups and stakeholders have come forward with specific proposals including outlined priorities for the funds ranging from affordable housing to cultural projects to transportation priorities as well as many others. LMDC will continue to meet with community groups regarding specific funding proposals as well as attend community board meetings and other forums where potential projects are identified and discussed. LMDC intends to explore all factors and determine the most effective uses for these funds in a manner that will create the most impact in the comprehensive revitalization of Lower Manhattan.

LMDC received one comment opposing the expenditure of additional funds for the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program. The comment specifically alleges non-compliance, by the LMDC, with statutes of public input and procurement practices.

The WTC Memorial and Cultural Program has been the subject of a number of Partial Action Plans, competitive planning initiatives, hearings and exhibits, and request for proposals, many of which were designed specifically to engage the public and to gather public input. As noted on page 5, LMDC has conducted extensive public outreach and participation initiatives.

LMDC develops Partial Action Plan documents to outline all proposed expenditures of CDBG funds and to provide descriptions for all funding projects and initiatives. Partial Action Plans are released to the public for comment for a period of 30 days (extended from 15 days in Partial Action Plan 7), and are widely disseminated throughout Lower Manhattan communities upon release. All LMDC Partial Action Plans may be viewed and downloaded on the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com. Following the public comment phase, they are submitted to HUD for approval. At the time this comment was received, LMDC had issued 10 Partial Action Plans for public comment, of which, eight were approved by HUD.

LMDC will continue to engage the public and gather public input through public hearings and meetings throughout Lower Manhattan communities on various funding activities. These forums provide LMDC an opportunity to gather input from various community stakeholders, including residents, large and small business owners, elected officials, and civic organizations.

VIII. Responses to Public Comments on the First Amendment to the Partial Action Plan

This section outlines comments received from the public on the first proposed amendments to Partial Action Plan 8 from May 17, 2005 through June 15, 2005. The following section details the thirteen comments received and responses to those comments.

WORLD TRADE CENTER MEMORIAL AND CULTURAL PROGRAM

LMDC received seven comments from 9/11 Family Members stating various objections to WTC Memorial and Cultural Program. The comments include: 1) all seven of the comments object to the placement of, and allocation of funds for, cultural programming at the WTC Site, specifically the International Freedom Center and other planned cultural institutions; 2) two of the comments stated objections related to the underground design components of the Memorial and Memorial center; 3) one of the comments stated objections to the allocation of funds for the cultural institutions to participate in River to River 2005; and 4) one of the comments stated objections to the allocation of funds to the WTC Memorial Foundation, particularly for cultural programming at the WTC Site.

In the aftermath of the September 11 attacks, LMDC and the Port Authority jointly undertook an extensive and historic public planning process focused on rebuilding the WTC site and creating a permanent memorial to the victims. This comprehensive planning process resulted in the selection of Studio Daniel Libeskind's *Memory Foundations* to serve as the master plan for the redevelopment. The master plan provides for a permanent Memorial and Memorial Museum, as well as cultural, open space, and commercial uses at the WTC Site, and extends to include an additional four acres south of Liberty Street, permitting the relocation of portions of the commercial space, adding open space, rebuilding of the church that was in that area on September 11, and placement of truck and bus-servicing infrastructure away from the memorial area.

Throughout the planning process LMDC has sought and received public feedback on the master plan and all uses at the WTC Site through numerous public meetings, exhibits, regulatory review processes, and LMDC's interactive website. LMDC is committed to continuing to work with victims' families, residents, survivors, and all those impacted by September 11th to honor the lives we lost, build a fitting memorial, and realize the master plan for the WTC site.

LMDC received one comment requesting funding for the development of a "Meditation and Healing Garden" at the WTC Site.

On January 6, 2004, following the historic international WTC Site Memorial Competition, LMDC announced the selection of *Reflecting Absence* by Michael Arad and Peter Walker to serve as the design for the Memorial. *Reflecting Absence* powerfully articulates the footprints of the Twin Towers, conveying the primary symbol of void and loss. At the same time, it provides for the surrounding plaza design to include teeming groves of trees as a symbol of life and rebirth. The WTC Memorial and Memorial Center will provide the opportunity for future programming and space for remembering and honoring all those lost. For more information on the WTC Memorial and Memorial Center, please visit the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com.

LMDC received one comment asserting that the tallest building in the world should be placed at the WTC Site. The comment further expressed disapproval of the Museum Complex building.

On June 29, 2005, Governor George E. Pataki, Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg, WTC developer Larry A. Silverstein, and architect David Childs announced the revised design for the Freedom Tower (now referred to as One WTC). The Freedom Tower soars to 1,776 feet, highlighting the New York City Skyline. For more information on One WTC (the Freedom Tower), please visit the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com.

LMDC received two comments that advocated that the twin towers be rebuilt at the WTC Site as designed by Donald Trump.

LMDC continues to accept comments related to the redevelopment of the WTC Site and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan. The restoration alternative was considered as part of the environmental review process completed on June 2, 2004 discussed on page 8. After an extensive and historic public planning process, LMDC is moving forward with *Memory Foundations* by Studio Dan Libeskind, which serves as the master plan for the WTC site. For more information on the developments at the WTC site, please visit the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com.

GENERAL COMMENTS

LMDC received one comment from a 9/11 Family member objecting to the allocation of funds without accountability specifically related to the draft Allocation Plan.

LMDC continues to place a priority on seeking public comments for its activities. On April 13, 2005 LMDC publicly released a draft Allocation Plan to guide the allocation of LMDC's remaining Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds. The draft Allocation Plan articulated principles and objectives, priorities, and allocation categories. The draft Allocation Plan was guided by over 75 public meetings and tens-of-thousands of public comments. As part of the release and public comment period, LMDC conducted a public hearing at the Museum of the American Indian in Lower Manhattan on April 27, 2005 to provide various stakeholders with an additional forum for providing feedback. As a result of the additional comments received by the public— including 9/11 family members, elected officials, civic and cultural organizations— LMDC revised the Allocation Plan. Both the draft and revised funding Allocation Plans are available on the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com.

On May 25, 2005, Governor George E. Pataki and Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg announced a comprehensive allocation plan for the remaining LMDC Community Development Block Grant funds. Elements of the plan included funding for the WTC Memorial Foundation, Lower Manhattan community and cultural amenities, neighborhood rejuvenation projects, and investments in Chinatown. Information on specific projects outlined as part of the announcement was provided in future Partial Action Plan drafts for public comment.

LMDC received one comment regarding the LMDC Draft Allocation Plan that supported the allocation of \$70 million to build the Lower Manhattan section of Hudson River Park.

The amendments to Partial Action Plan 8 pertain to the allocation of additional funds for the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program and River to River 2005. On June 16, 2005, the LMDC Board approved the allocation of funds for Hudson River Park. More information on this project will be provided in future Partial Action Plans.