

## LOWER MANHATTAN DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

**Amended Final Action Plan  
For  
Lower Manhattan Disaster Recovery and Rebuilding Efforts**

**Overview**

The Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC) has prepared this Final Action Plan with regards to the \$2 billion federal appropriation for the World Trade Center disaster recovery and rebuilding efforts administered by the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). LMDC has received additional funding through a \$783 million federal appropriation to HUD for damaged properties and businesses (including the restoration of utility infrastructure) as well as economic revitalization related to the terrorist attacks at the World Trade Center (WTC). Partial action plans detailing the expenditure of the other funds from the \$2.783 billion appropriation and are viewable on the LMDC website at <http://renewnyc.com/FundingInitiatives/PartialActionPlans.aspx>.

Activities	Original Allocation 12/2006 Revised 2/27/13	Amended Allocation Approved by HUD 12/18/15	Amended Plan Revised 6/30/16
<b>I. WTC Memorial and Cultural</b>			
A. Reserve Fund	\$44,000,000	\$44,000,000	\$44,000,000
B. WTC Construction Coordination	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,000
C. WTC Memorial Tribute in Light	\$810,000	\$810,000	\$810,000
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$45,810,000</b>	<b>\$45,810,000</b>	<b>\$45,810,000</b>
<b>II. Affordable Housing</b>	<b>\$12,000,000</b>	<b>\$12,000,000</b>	<b>\$12,000,000</b>
<b>III. Community &amp; Cultural Enhancement</b>			
A. Community & Cultural Enhancement Fund	\$56,726,330	\$55,162,981	\$55,162,981
B. Cultural & Community Events & Installations	\$4,045,000	\$4,044,970	\$4,044,970
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$60,771,330</b>	<b>\$59,207,951</b>	<b>\$59,207,951</b>
<b>IV. Economic Development</b>	<b>\$6,775,000</b>	<b>\$6,775,000</b>	<b>\$6,928,418</b>
<b>V. Education</b>			
A. East Side K-8	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000
B. Educational Needs	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$6,000,000</b>	<b>\$6,000,000</b>	<b>\$6,000,000</b>
<b>VI. Transportation</b>	<b>\$15,835,000</b>	<b>\$15,835,000</b>	<b>\$15,835,000</b>
<b>VII. World Trade Center Ship</b>		<b>\$2,100,000</b>	<b>\$2,100,000</b>
<b>Final Action Plan Totals</b>	<b>\$147,191,330</b>	<b>\$147,727,951</b>	<b>\$147,881,369</b>

The Final Action Plan was initially approved by HUD on December 6, 2006 with a total allocation of \$184,950,849 for the activities shown above. The sources of the allocations in that Final Action Plan were previously unallocated funds as well as funds reallocated through amended Partial Action Plans 1, 2, 4, 6, 8, 9, and 11. An initial amendment that reduced funding for Economic Development by \$23,000,000 allocating these funds to the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program for 130 Liberty Street and reduced the total allocation to \$161,950,849 was approved by HUD on July 11, 2007. A second amendment that altered the activities to add WTC Construction Coordination and to reallocate \$1,000,000 to such activities from the Reserve Fund was made on December 21, 2007. A third amendment that updated descriptions of certain programs and allocated funds to a new Cultural and Community Events and Installations category of projects within Community and Cultural Enhancement Program was made on January 15, 2009. A fourth amendment that altered the allocations for Community and Cultural Enhancement Program, identified additional Cultural

and Community Events and Installations projects, reduced funding for Economic Development, and reduced the total allocation for the Final Action Plan to \$161,546,330 was made on August 12, 2010. A fifth amendment that increased funding for Cultural and Community Events and Installations and the WTC Memorial, provided funding for an East River Waterfront Pier 42 project, identified the WTC memorial as a recipient of Transportation funds, reduced funding for Transportation projects, and reduced the total allocation for the Final Action Plan to \$147,191,330 was made on February 27, 2013. The sixth amendment created a new activity, *World Trade Center Ship*, with \$2,100,000 of funding from a Partial Action Plan 11 Cultural Enhancement Fund reallocation and Final Action Plan reallocations from the Community & Cultural Enhancement Fund and Cultural & Community Events & Installations activities. This amendment was approved by HUD on December 18, 2015. The seventh amendment, which increased the Economic Development activity balance by \$153,418 to \$6,928,418, was made on June 30, 2016 as a result of the reallocation of remaining funds from completed programs in Partial Action Plans 1 and 9. Residual balances from the previously completed Residential Grant (\$123,745) and Employee Training and Assistance (\$8,229) programs in Partial Action Plan (PAP) 1, and \$21,444 from the Lower Manhattan Public Information Program in PAP 9 were swept to the Final Action Plan resulting in the closing of PAPs 1 and 9.

Approved, amended, and proposed amended Partial Action Plans are available on LMDC's website, <http://renewnyc.com/FundingInitiatives/PartialActionPlans.aspx>.

Any change greater than 5% in the funding committed to a certain program, the addition or deletion of any program, or change in the designated beneficiaries of a program constitutes a substantial amendment and such amendment will be available for public review and approval by HUD.

### **National Objective**

LMDC is a subsidiary of the New York State Urban Development Corporation d/b/a Empire State Development that was created in December 2001 to oversee the rebuilding and revitalization of Lower Manhattan. The activities contained in this Final Action Plan have been designed to meet the particularly urgent community development needs resulting from the September 11th WTC disaster. These activities also have particular urgency because LMDC has determined that existing conditions resulting from the disaster pose a serious and immediate threat to the health or welfare of New York City and the individual residents of the City and other financial resources are not available to meet such needs. Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan are for the prevention of blight that could result absent intervention to address the existing conditions resulting from the events of September 11th. Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan will also benefit low-and-moderate-income people. The geographic focus of this Final Action Plan is the entire area of Manhattan south of Houston Street.

### **Public Comment to the Final Action Plan**

The initial Final Action Plan was made available to the public for comment from September 29, 2006 through October 30, 2006. LMDC did not receive any comments on the initial Final Action Plan. The first amendment was made available to the public for comment from March 26 through April 25, 2007. LMDC received no comments on this first amendment. The second and third amendments and portions of the fourth amendment were non-substantial amendments that were not released for public comment. The portion of the fourth amendment relating to a reduction in funding for Community and Cultural Enhancements was made available to the public for comment from March 22, 2010 through April 20, 2010. LMDC received no comments on this amendment. The portion of the fifth amendment relating to the increase in Cultural and Community Events and Installations and the portion relating to the funding of the new East River Waterfront Pier 42 project activity were made available to the public for comment from March 31, 2012 to April 30, 2012. LMDC received one relevant public comment on this amendment from Community Board 3 strongly supporting the allocation of funds to the new East River Waterfront Pier 42 project. The sixth amendment was made available to the public for comment from August 28, 2015 through September 30, 2015. LMDC did not receive any comments on the Amendment. The seventh amendment did not require public comment.

Public comments were accepted by posted mail and electronic mail. LMDC placed Invitations to Public Comment for Partial Action Plan in English, Spanish and Chinese daily newspapers and in weekly community newspapers serving Lower Manhattan. In addition, the text of the draft plan was made available on LMDC's website <http://renewnyc.com/FundingInitiatives/PartialActionPlans.aspx>.

LMDC delivered and mailed copies of this Final Action Plan and the first, fourth, fifth and sixth amendments in English, Spanish, and Chinese to more than 50 community, residential, civic and cultural organizations throughout Lower Manhattan, including Community Board 1, 2 and 3, several tenants' associations and public libraries. In addition, LMDC sent electronic notices of Final Action Plan in three languages to elected officials, LMDC's Advisory Council members, and over 100 Lower Manhattan civic, community and cultural organizations.

### **Public Participation to Date**

As described in earlier Partial Action Plans (PAPs), LMDC has solicited and received an unprecedented amount of public comment from around the world regarding the rebuilding of the WTC Site, the creation of a permanent memorial, and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan. LMDC also established several Advisory Councils representing a broad spectrum of groups affected by the WTC attacks, including victims' families, business owners, arts and cultural institutions, and downtown residents that have consulted with LMDC on issues of concern to their respective constituencies. Additionally, LMDC's special Advisory Committees such as the Memorial Mission Statement and Program Committees, the Memorial Center Advisory Committee, the 130 Liberty Street Advisory Committee, and the Section 106 Historic Resources Consulting Parties provide guidance on specific projects and issues.

LMDC has sponsored and participated in over 100 public meetings and workshops to provide the public with forums to express their views on redevelopment of Lower Manhattan, in the aftermath of September 11, 2001. In addition to large-scale public meetings, LMDC, in conjunction with The City of New York, conducted a series of outreach workshops on overall funding priorities for each of Lower Manhattan's neighborhoods in 2003. At the workshops, participating members of the community described priorities for their communities and proposed projects to address those priorities. The report on these workshops is available on the LMDC website at [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com). Public meetings have also focused on a variety of specific topics, including the environmental review process, WTC site planning, the creation of a permanent memorial, neighborhood funding priorities, content for the Memorial Museum, and cultural, recreational, and other public spaces.

LMDC has conducted additional outreach initiatives, participates in Community Board meetings, and meets regularly with community groups, civic organizations, and public officials. LMDC has sponsored several public exhibits that have provided visitors with information and the opportunity to submit written comments on the revitalization efforts. LMDC has received over 10,000 comments at these exhibits and through the LMDC website. LMDC also receives additional input on potential Lower Manhattan projects and programs in the form of unsolicited proposals and funding applications.

Based on public input, through the channels outlined above, LMDC produced numerous program documents that have guided the redevelopment and revitalization process, beginning with *The Principles and Preliminary Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan* in 2002. This document established the groundwork for the rebuilding and revitalization efforts by outlining the goals and objectives for the revitalization, along with the necessary actions to realize them. This and other information regarding public participation in the redevelopment and revitalization process are available on the LMDC website at [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com).

On April 13, 2005, the LMDC released a report titled *The Public Dialogue and Lower Manhattan Revitalization Initiatives* that outlined the principles, objectives, priorities, and allocation options for LMDC's remaining CDBG funds. LMDC solicited, received, and reviewed hundreds of public comments through May 1, 2005, and released a revised Funding Allocation Framework on May 25, 2005.

On June 16, 2005, the LMDC Board of Directors adopted a Funding Allocation Plan, consistent with the Funding Allocation Framework, for the remaining federal CDBG funds. The Funding Allocation Plan outlined the allocation of funds for specific projects at the WTC Site and throughout Lower Manhattan. The Funding Allocation Framework and the Funding Allocation Plan are available on the LMDC's website at [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com).

In July 2006, the LMDC Board of Directors authorized the issuance of this Final Action Plan to allocate the remaining funds in the \$2 billion grant to projects that LMDC has determined, through its extensive public process, are priorities for the rebuilding and revitalization of Lower Manhattan.

## **I. World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program**

### **Needs and Objective**

On September 11, 2001, terrorist attacks killed 2,749 people and destroyed every structure on the WTC site, including all five office towers, commercial and governmental low-rise buildings, the hotel, the central outdoor plaza, the underground concourse, the PATH terminal and subway stations. Nearby structures immediately to the south of the WTC site were also destroyed or damaged; the Deutsche Bank office tower at 130 Liberty Street was severely damaged and St. Nicholas Church at 155 Cedar Street was destroyed. Together, these devastated sites totaled over 20 acres and the aftermath rippled throughout Lower Manhattan. The significant loss of life, jobs, and commercial and open space affected the vitality of Lower Manhattan and posed a threat to the financial, emotional, and cultural vitality of the neighborhood. As outlined in Partial Action Plans 7, 8 and 11, the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program has helped counter the blighting effect of the events of September 11, 2001, and has provided a permanent memorial for current and future generations to remember and honor the nearly 3,000 people who died on that day in New York City, in Shanksville, Pennsylvania, and at the Pentagon, as well as those who died in the terrorist bombing at the WTC on February 26, 1993. The project restored the WTC Site, repairing the underlying fabric of Lower Manhattan, and helps foster the growth of Lower Manhattan as a vibrant cultural and financial district.

### **World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan**

The culmination of LMDC's planning efforts for the redevelopment of the WTC area is the World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan (WTC Plan), developed in cooperation with The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (Port Authority), the owner of the WTC Site. LMDC employed an extensive public process for over two years to develop the WTC Plan and related initiatives. As part of the Plan, LMDC proposed to implement new memorial and cultural uses, including the Memorial and Memorial Museum, as outlined in LMDC's World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program General Project Plan (GPP), as amended. The Port Authority is responsible for the commercial, retail, conference center and hotel facilities, open space areas, and infrastructure components of the WTC Plan. LMDC conducted a coordinated environmental review of the combined WTC Plan. Detailed information regarding the components of this process may be found on LMDC's website at [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com) under the links in the section entitled "The Plan."

### **World Trade Center Memorial Foundation, Inc.**

The National September 11 Memorial & Museum at the World Trade Center Foundation, Inc. (Foundation), formerly known as the World Trade Center Memorial Foundation, Inc., is a not-for-profit corporation established to (i) honor the innocent men, women and children murdered in the horrific terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 through the creation of a permanent memorial at the WTC Site and (ii) promote the economic and cultural vitality of Lower Manhattan through the development of cultural facilities at the WTC site. The Foundation Board of Directors is composed of civic and business leaders, leading philanthropists, statesmen, and victims' family members from around the world. In addition, Presidents Jimmy Carter, George H.W. Bush, and William J. Clinton serve as Honorary Members, and have pledged their support for the Foundation. For more information regarding the Foundation please visit their website at: <http://www.911memorial.org/>.

The Memorial, Memorial Museum, and cultural institutions have been funded with a combination of public resources and private funds donated by individuals and groups, including more than \$300 million from LMDC.

### **World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program – Project Area**

The project area is located in Lower Manhattan on two sites (1) the WTC site, bounded generally by West, Vesey, Church, and Liberty Streets; and (2) several parcels immediately to the south of the WTC Site (collectively, Southern Site) comprising (a) two city blocks, one bounded by Liberty, Washington, Albany and Greenwich Streets, and one bounded by Liberty, West, Cedar and Washington Streets, (b) subsurface portions of Liberty Street between the eastern side of West Street to the western side of Greenwich Street, (c) Washington Street from the northern side of Cedar Street and to the southern side of Liberty Streets, and (d) subsurface portions of Cedar Street from the eastern side of West Street to the eastern side of Washington Street. The Southern Site includes those properties commonly known as 130 Liberty Street, 140 Liberty Street, and 155 Cedar Street.

### **World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program – Project Objectives**

As outlined in Partial Action Plan 8, the WTC Memorial and Memorial Museum (Memorial/Museum) are at the heart of the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program and serve to both remember and honor the victims of the September 11, 2001 and February 26, 1993 terrorist attacks and have revitalized Lower Manhattan, eliminated blight effectively addressing the conditions at the WTC site that resulted from the events of September 11, 2001. LMDC has partnered with the Foundation on a broad spectrum of activities related to the planning, design, and implementation of the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program.

In the initial Final Action Plan, LMDC provided \$45,000,000 of funding for a reserve fund for the Memorial/Museum. Funds were made available to address unforeseen events or unavoidable costs related to the construction of the Memorial/Museum, including excess infrastructure costs. These funds supplemented LMDC's previous allocations to the Memorial/Museum project, which included \$250,000,000 to the Foundation for design and construction as well as \$12,875,000 for planning. The Port Authority had committed to fund any additional costs incurred beyond the anticipated budget for the Memorial/Museum up to \$45,000,000, including the first \$25,000,000.

The December 2007 amendment to the Final Action Plan reallocated funds from the reserve for the Memorial/Museum to construction coordination activities at the WTC site. LMDC provided \$1,000,000 for construction coordination activities to assist in the implementation of the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program. The object of this coordination was to improve the construction process and identify efficiency improvements and cost savings.

The February 2013 amendment to the Final Action Plan allocated \$810,000 of additional funding for the Memorial/Museum to provide for three annual productions of Tribute in Light in 2012, 2013, and 2014. In this production two beams of light rise from a site near the WTC site into the night sky to honor those lost on September 11, 2001 and to celebrate the spirit of all the New Yorkers who have worked to rebuild and renew New York City. Conceived in the aftermath of September 11th, Tribute in Light is an artistic gesture bringing together the vision and talent of numerous individuals who, shortly after the attacks, independently envisioned two beams of light rising from downtown New York. Support of this installation is consistent with the Memorial/Museum's mission to create a permanent memorial honoring those lost. It has provided a valuable public service in that its continuation has ensured that on each anniversary of September 11, 2001, the thousands of people who were killed that day, the loss of the WTC buildings and its impact on New York City and beyond has been commemorated.

## **Beneficiaries**

The beneficiaries of the Memorial/Museum are the thousands of relatives and friends of the nearly 3,000 victims of September 11, 2001, and February 26, 1993 and the thousands of visitors annually. The Memorial/Museum has provided a place to remember and honor those killed and has fostered greater public awareness of the events of February 26, 1993, and September 11, 2001, and the impact on the victims' families, survivors, area residents, New York City, and beyond. This project has also benefitted businesses, workers, and residents throughout Lower Manhattan and will continue to contribute to the overall economic recovery of Lower Manhattan and New York City, including low and moderate income persons.

## **Schedule**

LMDC has carried out activities relating to the development and implementation of the WTC Plan since early 2002 with construction coordination activities beginning in 2007. The Memorial and Memorial Museum have been constructed and are open to the public. The full implementation of other cultural components of the plan may extend into 2019.

## **Federal and other resources**

The initial Final Action Plan provided \$45,000,000 as a reserve fund for the Memorial/Museum. The December 2007 amendment to the Final Action Plan reallocated \$1,000,000 from this reserve fund for the Memorial/Museum to construction coordination activities at the WTC Site. This amendment reduced the allocation for the reserve fund for the Memorial/Museum from \$45,000,000 to \$44,000,000. This \$1,000,000 was subsequently restored thus returning the reserve to \$45,000,000. The February 2013 amendment to the Final Action Plan increased the allocation to the Memorial/Museum by \$810,000 to provide for annual productions of Tribute in Light in 2012, 2013, and 2014. Prior to the \$810,000 allocation for Memorial/Museum productions of Tribute in Light in 2012, 2013, and 2014, LMDC provided \$3,840,000 for annual productions by the Municipal Arts Society from 2004 through 2011.

As amended, the Final Action Plan has allocated \$45,810,000 for the Memorial/Museum. Through Partial Action Plans 8, 11, 12, and S-2, LMDC has allocated \$278,519,972 to the project. The Memorial/Museum and its Pavilion entrance have been completed with additional funds obtained from private contributions and other government entities, including the Port Authority.

## **II. Affordable Housing**

### **Background**

In the aftermath of September 11th, many members of the Lower Manhattan residential and business communities experienced significant challenges, including financial challenges. Among the challenges is the need for affordable housing. LMDC has received specific public comments on the need for affordable housing in Lower Manhattan. In July and August 2003, LMDC and The City of New York (the City) held seven community workshops in Lower Manhattan to determine the needs of residents, businesses, and other members of Lower Manhattan communities, and to discuss ways in which to address these needs. At the community workshops, residents, and community-based organizations voiced concerns about a lack of affordable housing in Lower Manhattan. The need to build and preserve affordable housing was widely discussed. LMDC has also received comments relating to affordable housing via its funding application processes. Elected officials, community-based organizations, and planning groups have recommended the creation and preservation of affordable housing in Lower Manhattan. In *New York City's Vision for Lower Manhattan*, Mayor Bloomberg set forth a plan to create new units of housing over the next ten years.



The creation of affordable housing also corresponds with LMDC's early *Principles and Revised Preliminary Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan*, which recommends, "expanding the residential population to create a strong sense of community throughout Lower Manhattan." It also recommends that, "housing must be for a wide variety of income levels."

On November 8, 2005, HUD approved Partial Action Plan 6, since amended, which initially provided an allocation of \$50 million for Affordable Housing. The projects included within Partial Action Plan 6 were:

- Tribeca Site 5B (completed)
- Chinatown/Lower East Side Acquisition Program (completed)
- Masaryk Towers Preservation (completed)
- Knickerbocker Village (completed)
- Fulton Corridor Residential Rehabilitation and Conversion Program (cancelled)

While Affordable Housing remains a priority of the LMDC and the City, LMDC and the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) determined that the Fulton Corridor Residential Rehabilitation and Conversion Program would not be effective as initially envisioned. Through this Final Action Plan, LMDC reallocated the \$8 million from the Fulton Corridor Housing Program and added another \$4 million, for a combined total of \$12 million that was allocated to an affordable housing program in Lower Manhattan administered by the City through HPD. HPD has issued a request for qualifications inviting not-for-profit sponsors to submit applications to receive funding assistance under the Lower Manhattan Acquisition Program for the acquisition and rehabilitation of eligible multi-family housing buildings in lower Manhattan.

### **Project Description**

HPD has and will continue to administer and allocate funds to projects that (1) provide affordable housing for low, moderate and middle income residents through the preservation of Mitchell Lama or other affordable housing complexes, acquisition of new land or properties for affordable housing or the creation of incentives for the private sector to develop affordable housing;<sup>1</sup> (2) are located in Lower Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street; (3) spend no more than \$125,000 per dwelling unit preserved or created; and (4) are consistent with the goals and principles outlined in HPD's "*The New Housing Marketplace: Creating Housing for the Next Generation*."<sup>2</sup>

Up to 10% of the Affordable Housing Program allocation may be used for project administration.

### **Schedule**

Projects remaining to be funded by the Affordable Housing Programs are expected to be identified by December 31, 2016.

### **Objective**

The creation of affordable housing is as a key component of a strong and vibrant Lower Manhattan community. As stated in LMDC's *Principles and Revised Preliminary Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan* "expanding the residential population [would] create a strong sense of community throughout Lower Manhattan," and "housing must be for a wide variety of income levels." The Affordable Housing Program would help achieve that outcome.

### **Beneficiaries**

This Affordable Housing Program will benefit moderate and low income residents of Lower Manhattan.

---

<sup>1</sup> Low income households are defined as those with income less than 50% of AMI, moderate income households are defined as those with income from 50% to 80% of AMI, and middle income households are defined as those with income less than 175% of AMI.

<sup>2</sup> HPD developed *The New Housing Marketplace* with an extensive advisory board and input from community boards and elected officials. It can be found at <http://www.nyc.gov/html/hpd/downloads/pdf/10yearHMplan.pdf>.

## **Project Area**

The project area for the Affordable Housing Program is defined as lower Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street.

## **Total Estimated Cost**

This Final Action Plan allocates \$12,000,000 of federal funds for affordable housing, bringing the total LMDC allocation for affordable housing to \$54,000,000. Other government and/or private resources may supplement these funds.

### **III. Community and Cultural Enhancement**

#### **Project Description**

The initial Final Action Plan allocated up to \$60,950,489 for Lower Manhattan Community and Cultural Enhancement Funds including the Drawing Center. The Community and Cultural Enhancement Funds were ultimately used to fund both the Community Enhancement Fund Program and the Community & Cultural Enhancement Fund Program while including the Drawing Center. These Programs have addressed a range of community and cultural needs by providing grants, through competitive selection processes, to not-for-profit and government organizations for projects and programs that have demonstrated or will demonstrate the ability to spur long-term Lower Manhattan revitalization, benefiting area residents, workers, businesses, and visitors.

The January 2009 amendment created the category within the Community and Cultural Enhancement Funds Program to provide for Lower Manhattan Cultural and Community Events and Installations. These projects provided a unique cultural or community event or installation that took place after 2008 that would not exist without LMDC funding. This amendment allocated \$3,000,000 to this category.

The August 2010 amendment reduced the total allocation for the Community and Cultural Enhancement Fund Program by \$171,519 to \$60,771,330. This was the combined result of two separate reallocations of funding. Funding was reduced by \$1,095,000 to provide funding for two cultural activities in Partial Action Plan 8 which are directly related to the WTC tragedy; Tribute in Light and the WTC StoryBooth. Funding was increased by \$915,481 as a result of a reallocation of unused Cultural Enhancement funds remaining in PAP 11. This amendment also increased the allocation for Cultural and Community Events and Installations by \$150,000 and identified Project Rebirth filming and the annual September 11 ceremonies as recipients of these funds.

The February 2013 amendment allocated an additional \$895,000 of funds within Community and Cultural Enhancements to Cultural and Community Events and Installations increasing the amount from \$3,150,000 to \$4,045,000. The additional funds were used to increase the \$605,000 allocation for the 2010 and 2011 September 11th commemorative ceremonies by \$895,000 to \$1,500,000 enabling LMDC to reimburse the National September 11 Memorial and Museum for the full production costs associated with the annual September 11th ceremonies in 2010 and 2011.

The December 2015 amendment reduced the total allocation for the Community and Cultural Enhancement Fund Program by \$1,563,349 to \$55,162,981, and reduced the Cultural & Community Events & Installations allocation by its residual balance of \$30 to \$4,044,970, reallocating the \$1,563,379 to the Final Action Plan activity – World Trade Center Ship. The November amendment to Partial Action Plan 11 reallocated \$536,621 of Lower Manhattan Cultural Enhancement Funds to the Final Action Plan also for the World Trade Center Ship. As a result, \$2,100,000 has been allocated for World Trade Center Ship.



### *Community Enhancement Fund*

The Community Enhancement Fund has been allocated by LMDC to not-for-profit and government organizations whose projects support community facilities or programs that (a) provide education, employment, and health care services, and/or (b) recreational or community gathering needs. Also eligible were capital projects to acquire, enhance access to, improve, or rehabilitate existing community facilities.

Funding application forms and guidelines, including criteria for selection, for the Community Enhancement Fund were made available on LMDC's website, [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com) on October 13, 2006. Applications were due by November 10, 2006. LMDC reviewed applications and convened an Advisory Panel comprised of representatives from New York City and State agencies and others knowledgeable about the needs of Lower Manhattan that made funding recommendations to LMDC based on the published guidelines. The recommendations and an adjunct process that followed resulted in the approval of a slate of 35 grants for Lower Manhattan community enhancement projects.

### *Community & Cultural Enhancement Program*

Community & Cultural Enhancement Program (CCEP) funds have been allocated by LMDC to not-for-profit and government organizations whose projects and programs provided for community or cultural facilities or programming in Lower Manhattan and demonstrated the ability to spur long-term Lower Manhattan revitalization, as well as benefits to area residents, workers, businesses and visitors. Grants were provided to not-for-profit organizations that, through proposed or existing facilities and activities, demonstrated excellence, animated the neighborhood and supported cultural life in Lower Manhattan. Emphasis was placed on projects that received planning grants in the first rounds of cultural (as approved in Partial Action Plan 11) or community funding as well as new proposals that had the potential to contribute to the development of clusters or corridors of community or cultural activity in revitalization zones, including the WTC area, Fulton and Greenwich Streets and the waterfronts.

Funding applications for additional grants from the CCEP Fund were submitted to LMDC in accordance with the application forms and guidelines, including the criteria for selection, which were available on LMDC's website, [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com). LMDC reviewed applications and convened an Advisory Panel comprised of representatives from New York City and State agencies and others knowledgeable about the needs of Lower Manhattan, which made funding recommendations to LMDC based on the guidelines. Any funding not previously awarded through the Cultural Enhancement Fund (PAP 11) or Community Enhancement Fund processes was allocated using the CCEP applications and guidelines described above.

### *Cultural and Community Events and Installations*

Up to \$4,045,000 was allocated as critical funding for Lower Manhattan Cultural and Community Events and Installations. These funds were allocated by LMDC to not-for-profit organizations that have developed projects for cultural or community events or installations in Lower Manhattan that would benefit area residents, workers, businesses, and visitors in the near term and had significant funding in place, but demonstrated a need for limited additional funding for the project to be realized after 2008. Allocations for these projects were made at the discretion of LMDC. These projects were completed.

#### The New York City Waterfalls

LMDC allocated up to \$2 million of the approximately \$16 million total project budget to the Public Art Fund for the administration and presentation in 2008 of The New York City Waterfalls. The Waterfalls were comprised of four 90 to 120-foot tall man-made waterfalls designed by Olafur Eliasson for display from late June 2008 through mid-October 2008 at sites along the shores of Brooklyn, Manhattan and Governor's Island, with each location viewable from Lower Manhattan buildings and public spaces, including the East River Esplanade or Battery Park. This event brought thousands of people to the Lower Manhattan viewing locations.

Tribute in Light

LMDC allocated an additional \$145,000 toward the \$400,000 project budget (at that time) to the Municipal Arts Society for the administration and presentation in 2009 of Tribute in Light. Earlier presentations of this project were funded through Partial Action Plan 8 while subsequent funding was provided for this project to the National September 11 Memorial & Museum at the World Trade Center Foundation, Inc. as described earlier in this Final Action Plan. The allocation of additional funds through this Final Action Plan, when combined with funds allocated in Partial Action Plan 8, allowed its presentation through September 11, 2014 as an interim memorial. Conceived in the aftermath of the September 11, 2001 tragedies, Tribute in Light is an artistic gesture bringing together the vision and talent of numerous individuals who, shortly after the attacks, independently envisioned two beams of light rising from downtown. Illuminating the night sky, Tribute in Light can be seen from up to 25 miles away in all directions.

Tribeca Film Festival Family Festival

LMDC allocated \$100,000 of the approximate \$465,000 total project budget to the Tribeca Film Institute for the administration and presentation in 2008 of Tribeca Film Festival's Family Festival. The Tribeca Film Institute had been funded in the past by LMDC through Partial Action Plans 7 and 11. Since 2002, Tribeca Film Festival has been a major event drawing hundreds of thousands of visitors to Lower Manhattan. The Family Festival is a street fair and family celebration for visitors and area residents alike, in which an array of activities and performances unfold over a seven-block stretch of Greenwich Street from Duane to Hubert Streets. Local schools, merchants, restaurants, and civic organizations participated in these all day, family-friendly celebrations. Special performances were held all day long on boulevard stages and in the streets, along with surprise appearances by favorite characters from movies, books, and television.

Project Rebirth

LMDC allocated \$300,000 of the approximate \$970,000 needed to complete filming and post-production work on the Project Rebirth film. Project Rebirth was funded in the past by LMDC through a \$1,000,000 Cultural Enhancement Fund grant as described in Partial Action Plan 11. Project Rebirth's mission was to document the reconstruction of the WTC site and the experiences of individuals directly affected by the events of September 11<sup>th</sup>. Through this project, Project Rebirth successfully ensured that people today and in future generations could experience the rebuilding process, and learn from our nation's ability to recover.

September 11 Commemoration

LMDC allocated \$1,500,000 to The National September 11 Memorial & Museum at the World Trade Center Foundation, Inc. to provide for costs related to the 2010 September 11th Commemoration. LMDC funding was necessary due to the fact that private support for the annual ceremony through in-kind and cash donations had significantly diminished at that time and was not sufficient to cover the costs through 2011. At the same time, the ongoing need for the ceremony remained as we approached the ten-year anniversary of the attacks. LMDC funds covered the out-of-pocket costs of production, including engineering, equipment, labor, lighting, power, site security, services, and supplies.

*Drawing Center*

A Partial Action Plan 11 amendment reallocated \$8 million of Drawing Center funds to the Final Action Plan ultimately making \$895,000 available for the Cultural & Community Events & installations Program and \$5,850,440 available for the Community & Cultural Enhancement Program leaving sufficient funding available for the Drawing Center for capital expenditures related to a new location in Lower Manhattan. The Drawing Center received funding enabling them to establish their home in Lower Manhattan allowing the institution to reach larger and more diverse audiences through a variety of exhibitions and programs, as well as expand and broaden its educational programming.

Up to 10% of the Community and Cultural Enhancement Funds were available for project administration.

## **Schedule**

The application and review processes for each of the Community Enhancement Fund and the Community & Cultural Enhancement Program were completed in 2007 and 2008. The Events and Installations took place in 2008 and 2009. The Drawing Center secured its home in Lower Manhattan in 2012.

## **Objectives**

Following an extensive public outreach and planning process, providing amenities and services necessary to support the residential and business community had emerged as an important Lower Manhattan redevelopment objective. Providing necessary, amenities, including but not limited to, infrastructure, services, and recreational activities, has served and will continue as a catalyst for increased residential, commercial, retail, and other neighborhood activities. In realizing this objective, the Community and Cultural Enhancement Funds were intended for projects in Lower Manhattan that would meet the needs resulting from the events of September 11, 2001; the selected projects have addressed or prevented blight, and benefited low-and-moderate-income communities and will continue to do so. Funded projects have had or will have the capacity to spur the revitalization of Lower Manhattan and successfully benefit area businesses, residents, and/or visitors.

## **Beneficiaries**

The Community and Cultural Enhancement Program benefits Lower Manhattan residents, workers, businesses, and not-for-profit organizations including low-and-moderate-income people, while addressing or preventing blight, and meeting the needs resulting from September 11, 2001.

## **Project Area**

The project area for the Community and Cultural Enhancement Program is lower Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street, including portions of the East River.

## **Federal and other resources**

This Final Action Plan, as amended, has allocated up to \$59,207,951 for the Community and Cultural Enhancement Program. Other government and/or private resources have supplemented these funds.

# **IV. Economic Development**

## **Background**

For Lower Manhattan to continue to recover from the attacks of September 11th, new opportunities to increase economic activity needed to be developed. Creating new residential neighborhoods, attracting new commercial and retail tenants to Lower Manhattan, and spurring construction to generate new jobs were important goals consistent with LMDC's *Principles and Revised Preliminary Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan*. One project that was explored to reconnect Lower Manhattan's neighborhoods, create a new residential neighborhood, and generate new jobs was the Greenwich Street South Plan, which was considered as a means to revitalize the area between Liberty Street and Battery Place, from Broadway to West Street. The 8-acre Brooklyn Battery Tunnel Plaza, which runs along Greenwich Street, represented the single-largest development opportunity downtown after the WTC site. An LMDC study of Greenwich Street South looked at ways to unlock the full potential of the Brooklyn Battery Tunnel Plaza, examining ways to add housing and neighborhood amenities to the area as well as ways to create new connections between neighborhoods. A bus garage for commuter buses was also under consideration. Funding was provided to support the regulatory review and possible implementation of the revitalization of Greenwich Street South although specific initiatives were not identified. In February 2007, \$23,000,000 of this funding was reallocated to Partial Action Plan 7. Then in August 2010, another \$225,000 was reallocated to partial

Action Plan 4 for long term planning initiatives leaving \$6,775,000 in the Final Action Plan for Economic Development activities including the Small Firm Assistance Program initiated in 2007 and still ongoing. On June 30, 2016, \$153,418 was reallocated to this activity from PAPs 1 and 9 thus increasing the Economic Development allocation to \$6,928,418.

### **Description**

The initial Final Action Plan allocated \$30 million for economic development initiatives in Lower Manhattan. The July 2007 amendment to the Final Action Plan reduced this allocation to \$7 million, the August 2010 amendment further reduced the allocation to \$6,775,000, and the June 2016 amendment increased the allocation to \$6,928,418. The New York City Economic Development Corporation (EDC) and the LMDC allocated \$6,000,000 of these funds to the Small Firms Assistance Program with the allocation of the remaining funds to be considered for projects that EDC and LMDC identify and determine will (1) increase economic activity in Lower Manhattan by spurring and promoting additional commercial and residential development; (2) attracting businesses and residents to locate in Lower Manhattan; and/or (3) providing short-term and/or long-term jobs in Lower Manhattan. Prior to allocating funding to any project, EDC or LMDC will engage public participation in the review of the project's ability to promote one or more of the above three goals and solicit and consider public input. Up to 10% of the Economic Development allocation may be used for project administration.

### **Schedule**

The Small Firms Assistance Project supported by the Economic Development Program was launched in 2007 and while additional projects may be identified in the future, this project continues successfully helping small businesses. The current project assists small firms affected by street construction and closures in Lower Manhattan and information is available on LMDC's website at [http://www.renewnyc.com/ProjectsAndPrograms/small\\_firms.asp](http://www.renewnyc.com/ProjectsAndPrograms/small_firms.asp)

### **Project objectives**

Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan were intended to spur activity to help the prevention of blight that could have resulted absent intervention and to address the conditions resulting from the events of September 11, 2001. Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan have and will continue to also benefit low-and-moderate-income people.

### **Beneficiaries**

The economic development project benefits Lower Manhattan residents, workers, businesses, and not-for-profit organizations, including low and moderate income persons and families.

### **Project Area**

The project area for the economic development program is lower Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street.

### **Federal and other resources**

The initial Final Action Plan allocated \$30,000,000 for economic development projects. The July 2007 amendment to the Final Action plan reallocated \$23,000,000 of these funds to the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program for 130 Liberty Street in Partial Action Plan 7. The August 2010 amendment reallocated \$225,000 of these funds to Long-Term Planning as described in Partial Action Plan 4 and the June 30, 2016 amendment increased the allocation by \$153,418. As amended, the Final Action Plan now allocates \$6,928,418 of federal funds for economic development projects. Other government and/or private resources may supplement these funds.

The \$23,000,000 allocated from the Final Action Plan to Partial Action Plan 7 for the WTC Memorial and Cultural Program for 130 Liberty Street was fully expended.

## V. Education

### Background

Lower Manhattan has been one of the fastest growing residential neighborhoods in New York City. As a result, the area has had a pressing need for educational resources, including additional classroom space. Providing adequate educational resources was identified as a key to retaining families in Lower Manhattan and has been a priority of LMDC. In Partial Action Plan 10, LMDC initially allocated \$20,000,000 toward the creation of a new K-8 school serving the residents of Lower Manhattan. This project received an additional \$3,000,000 from this Final Action Plan enabling the completion of the construction of that school in 2011 was completed. In Partial Action Plan 4, LMDC allocated \$3,000,000 to support construction of Millennium High School, the first public high school to be built in Lower Manhattan in many years. However, the School Construction Authority was able to complete that project without using LMDC funds. This \$3,000,000 was ultimately used in conjunction with the Community & Cultural Enhancement Program funding in support of the Fund for Public Schools project.

### Project Descriptions

#### *East Side K-8 School*

LMDC allocated an additional \$3,000,000 to the East Side K-8 School, in addition to the \$20,000,000 allocated in Partial Action Plan 10. As outlined in Partial Action Plan 10, the construction of an east side K-8 public school had long been advocated by the downtown community. This project resulted in the creation of a K-8 public school consisting of approximately 97,000 gross square feet. The K-8 public school was constructed in portions of the ground through fifth floors of a mixed-use development project, which included residential condominium, rental apartments, an ambulatory care facility for New York Downtown Hospital, as well as retail space, on Beekman Street adjacent to New York Downtown Hospital and Pace University. The site is bounded by Spruce Street to the north, Beekman Street to the south, and William Street to the east.

LMDC allocated \$3,000,000 from this Final Action Plan for costs associated with the K-8 school, including planning, design, and construction costs, as well as costs associated with any environmental review.

#### *Lower Manhattan Educational Needs*

This Final Action Plan also allocated \$3,000,000 for educational purposes in Lower Manhattan. Funds were used in conjunction with Community & Cultural Enhancement Program funding for The Fund for Public Schools to work with the Lower Manhattan public schools on the purchase new equipment and materials for the 2012-2013 school year. All funding provided was for schools located in Lower Manhattan that served low and moderate income students who live in Lower Manhattan.

Up to 10% of the Education allocation was available for project administration.

### Schedule

Construction of the East Side school began in 2007 and was completed for the opening of the 2011-12 school year. The Fund for Public Schools project was completed in 2013.

### Project Objectives

Ensuring the stability and continued growth of the residential population has been identified as key to Lower Manhattan's economic recovery since September 11, 2001. Having quality local schools with sufficient seating capacity has helped retain families in Lower Manhattan and has attracted new families with school-age children. Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan have helped attract and retain families to Lower Manhattan, prevented blight that could have resulted absent intervention to address the conditions resulting from the events of September 11th. Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan have and will continue to benefit low-and-moderate-income people.

## **Beneficiaries**

The projects funded have and will continue to benefit Lower Manhattan residents, children, and businesses, including low and moderate income persons and families.

## **Project Area**

The project area for the Education program is lower Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street.

## **Federal and Other Resources**

This Final Action Plan allocated a total of \$6,000,000 of federal funds for education projects. Other government and/or private resources may supplement these funds.

## **VI. Transportation Improvements**

### **Background**

Access to transportation has been identified as a competitive advantage for Lower Manhattan. Access to subways, the PATH station, ferries, bridges and tunnels has made Lower Manhattan an attractive place to live and work. As Lower Manhattan continues to grow, ensuring sufficient transportation will be a key to its continued success.

The initial Final Action Plan allocated \$31,000,000 to Transportation Improvements. The February 2013 amendment reduced the allocation to \$15,835,000 to allow for funding of Memorial/Museum Tribute in Light productions described above, the East River Waterfront Pier 42 project described in Partial Action Plan 10, and additional New York City Planning efforts described in Partial Action Plan 4. The February 2013 amendment also allowed the National September 11 Memorial & Museum at the World Trade Center Foundation, Inc. to allocate and implement Transportation Improvements.

### **Project Description**

This Final Action Plan allocated up to \$15,835,000 to address transportation improvements to benefit commuters, businesses, residents and pedestrians in Lower Manhattan. The City of New York and the National September 11 Memorial & Museum have and will continue to use these funds for projects within Lower Manhattan that accomplish one or more of the following:

- improve mobility
- improve connectivity between Lower Manhattan, the rest of New York City and the region
- promote the livability of Lower Manhattan; and/or encourage business development
- improve conditions for pedestrians and bicyclists;
- promote use of public transportation
- provide access to the streets for those vehicles that need it
- reduce congestion on the streets
- support traffic management and emergency response
- ease the impact of construction on residents, businesses and tourists

#### *Water Street Improvements*

The City of New York was allocated \$11,525,000 for the purposes of enhancing the identity of Water Street by creating a more pedestrian friendly environment. Approximately \$1,525,000 of these funds has been directed toward temporary improvements and wayfinding on Water Street led by The New York City Department of Transportation. Street trees, benches, painted curb extensions and art display cases have been added. The fabrication and installation of Wayfinding signs in the Financial District is expected to be completed in 2016.



The remaining \$10,000,000 has been made available to the New York City Economic Development Corporation for capital improvements which include landscaping alongside the corridor, new and expanded plazas, and curb extensions with amenities such as seating and plantings at key intersections from Whitehall Street to Fulton Street.

*West Street Sidewalk Improvements (\$4,000,000)*

The National September 11 Memorial & Museum worked with the State of New York Department of Transportation to provide for sidewalk improvements adjacent to the World Trade Center Memorial. For three sides of the Memorial Plaza within the WTC site, the sidewalks adjacent to the WTC Memorial were constructed to match the landscape design of the Memorial Plaza while including appropriate security measures. However, additional funding was needed for the sidewalks running along Route 9A on the exterior of the WTC site to similarly meet the security and aesthetic requirements of the Memorial. The New York State Department of Transportation completed this sidewalk work in 2014.

Up to 10% of the Transportation Improvements allocation may be used for project administration.

**Schedule**

Transportation Improvements projects were identified by June 2013 and are expected to be completed in 2018.

**Objectives**

Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan are for the prevention of blight that could result absent intervention to address conditions resulting from the events of September 11th. Funds allocated in this Final Action Plan have and will also benefit low-and-moderate-income people.

**Beneficiaries**

The transportation improvements to be funded will benefit Lower Manhattan residents, workers, businesses, and not-for-profit organizations, including low and moderate income persons and families.

**Project Area**

The project area for the Transportation Improvements projects is lower Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street.

**Federal and Other Resources**

This Final Action Plan allocates a total of \$15,835,000 of federal funds for transportation projects. Other government and/or private resources may supplement these funds.

**VII. World Trade Center Ship**

**Background**

In 2004, as part of LMDC's environmental obligations for the World Trade Center site, LMDC entered into an agreement regarding historic resources with the NYS Historic Preservation Office and the federal Advisory Council on Historic Preservation ("the Programmatic Agreement"). Under this agreement, if a historic resource is found during the site's reconstruction, state and federal officials need to be notified and a mitigation plan developed for the historic resource, subject to consultation with approximately 40 consulting parties identified in that agreement.

On July 13, 2010 archaeologists monitoring excavation of the WTC Site observed the curved timbers of the lower hull of what proved to be the stern of an 18th century ship. After the remnants were uncovered, LMDC assembled a team of ship experts and conservators to develop and execute a short-term mitigation

plan so the ship could be removed from the site in a controlled manner before its condition was threatened by exposure to the elements. The effort included protecting, recording, excavating, disassembling, packaging, and removing the vessel's components and associated artifacts from the project site.

A year later, remnants of the bow were discovered on the site. As a result of LMDC's efforts, remnants from both the bow and stern are currently in stable condition and are being stored at the Center for Maritime Archaeology and Conservation at Texas A&M University.

The NYS Historic Preservation Office has determined the ship is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. Only about a dozen colonial-era merchant ships have ever been professionally recorded nationwide. The WTC Ship is significant for its association with the rise in prominence of New York's port during the late 18th century, its association with the development of New York City's Hudson River shoreline, and for being an early example of a Hudson River Sloop.

After all the ship's materials were removed and analyzed, LMDC contacted institutions in the New York metropolitan area to determine their interest in displaying the WTC ship. The institution that expressed the greatest interest was the New York State Museum in Albany (Museum). The Museum intends to make the ship a centerpiece. The museum already displays a collection of materials from the World Trade Center and objects from the international response to the events of September 11, 2001.

### **Project Description**

The Final Action Plan, as amended, allocates \$2,100,000 for the World Trade Center Ship (WTC Ship) project. Up to \$1,000,000 is estimated to complete the environmental and planning processes as well as cover some costs associated with the preservation, restoration, and delivery of the WTC Ship to the Museum. Another \$1,100,000 is expected to be directed to the Museum and others, on behalf of the Museum, for costs associated with the analysis, preservation, reconstruction, and display of the WTC Ship remnant at the New York State Museum.

### **Schedule**

Parts of the World Trade Center Ship were uncovered on the WTC Site in 2010 and 2011. The WTC Ship will be subject to analysis, preservation and restoration until and after the ship is received by the Museum which is expected to be in 2020.

### **Objectives**

This activity meets urgent community development needs resulting from the September 11, 2001 World Trade Center disaster because LMDC had determined that site conditions resulting from the disaster posed a serious and immediate threat to the health or welfare of the City of New York and the individual residents of the City, and other financial resources were not available to meet such needs. The funds allocated to this activity contribute to the prevention of blight that could result absent intervention to address the existing conditions. Furthermore, funds allocated in this Final Action Plan for the WTC Ship will fulfill environmental mitigation requirements.

### **Beneficiaries**

The World Trade Center Ship project benefits residents, workers, businesses, and not-for-profit organizations, including low and moderate income persons and families.

### **Project Area**

The project area for the World Trade Center Ship is lower Manhattan.

### **Federal and Other Resources**

This Final Action Plan allocates a total of \$2,100,000 of federal funds for the World Trade Center Ship. Other government and/or private resources may supplement these funds.